Inclusive Education: A distant dream in India

By Dr. Mithu Alur

Teacher Challenges for Education for All, New Delhi
30th May, 2012
Malini Chib
Author, Writer, Librarian.

One Little Finger
Malini Chib
The First Phase: 1972 – 1998

A Holistic Service Combining Special Education, Treatment and Training Manpower Services
• ADAPT (Formerly The Spastics Society of India), founded by Mithu Alur in Mumbai, in 1972 at a time when very little was known in India about the complicated disorder called cerebral palsy.

• The then Prime Minister of India Late Shrimati Indira Gandhi helped to find the first premises. Our first Patron was the Late Smt. Nargis Dutt.
Technical Aspects

- It has early infant clinics where high-risk babies are assessed.

- A special context-specific evaluation has been developed over the years.
Extra Curricular Activities

Art and Craft Exhibition

Sports

Koli Dance

Annual Show 2010
**Macro Level Outcome**

- Cerebral palsy became recognised as one of the 11 classifications of the Government.
- Over the next twenty five years more than 5,000, babies, children and young people have come for assessment and remedial programmes over the last 35 years.
- With a slight modification in the curriculum and with skilled teachers, the students demonstrated that it was perfectly possible to be educated.
- Educational reforms took place allowing children to have writers and get extra time for their school and University exams.
- Teacher Training Courses decentralized the ideology and spread it around 18 of the 31 States.
Neenu Kewlani
Former Secretary to HRD Director, KPMG, Mumbai
Dr. Vipasha Mehta
Ph. d. In Philosophy
Nilesh Singit
Master in English Literature,
Worked with the Human Rights Law Network,
at present on the Amendments to the Persons with Disabilities Act
There are now education and therapy services for children with cerebral palsy in 18 out of the 31 states.

Andhra Pradesh
Assam
Delhi
Goa
Gujarat
Haryana
Jharkhand
Karnataka
Kerala
Madhya Pradesh
Maharashtra
Meghalaya
Orissa
Punjab
Rajasthan
Tamil Nadu
Uttar Pradesh
West Bengal
Transforming Pedagogy and Training:
Where there was no teacher
Transforming Pedagogy

- National Level Teacher Training Course (Diploma in the Education of Physically Handicapped) affiliated to Mumbai University
- National Level Therapists Training Course Management in Cerebral Palsy [MCP]
- Community Initiatives in Inclusion: An Asia pacific Course for Master Trainers
- Early Childhood Care and Education
- Training for ICDS Personnel
- Orientation for Parents, Volunteers and Staff.

Courses reviewed and the philosophy of inclusion is now a part of the revised curriculum in all the courses.
National Level Outcome: Over 400 teachers trained

- Andhra Pradesh
- Assam
- Delhi
- Goa
- Gujarat
- Haryana
- Jharkhand
- Karnataka
- Kerala
- Madhya Pradesh
- Maharashtra
- Meghalaya
- Orissa
- Rajasthan
- Punjab
- Tamil Nadu
- Uttar Pradesh
- West Bengal
Community Initiatives in Inclusion
Shifts in Thinking about Disability a new approach

- The Medical and Social Model of Disability
- Rights not Charity
- Human Rights Model
Language of Disability

Need to eliminate barriers arising for inappropriate nomenclature.
Peoples Attitude

“Normal is what everyone else is and you are not.”

Dr. Soran, to Geordi in Star Trek
Society prefers to label us so we are segregated
People don’t ask a disabled person.
Physical and Architectural Barriers
Segregation, Isolation from Society into special schools, Homes for the Disabled, asylums etc.
What is Inclusion?

Inclusive means all castes, religions, races, gender, abilities learning and working together.

Schools and communities which welcome all children and adults

- A Process
- A Journey
- Responsibility of all
- Building a community
A Ph.D. study of policy for the disabled in India (Alur 1999) examining a government policy revealed...

- 4-5 million children, under the age of 5 were without services.
- 90% of the disabled in the country living in socially disadvantaged areas in rural, tribal and urban slums received no services at all.
Distortion of policy resulting in the non-inclusion of disabled children

- **No political will and no EFA without inclusion**
- **Silence on the subject by international agencies and policy maker**
- **Conflict of resources**
- **Value: a social, cultural and ideological entrenchment**
- **Exclusion on a macro-scale**
- **Lack of a conceptual framework**
- **Political ambiguity**
- **Not a state responsibility**
- **An NGO dependency**
- **Political weakness and depoliticization**
Findings:

A Systemic Failure

90% out of any service
10% covered
(Source- GOI 1994)

Violation of Human Rights
Model 2: Shift in Ideology: From Segregation Education to Inclusive Education: micro, mezzo and macro strategies
The micro level was the level of classroom and school values, culture. It examined two key areas of: School Development and Training. This has been called the Whole School Approach.

The mezzo level was the level of the community. Based on an action research, we developed inclusive services within the community which we called the Whole Community Approach.

The macro level looked at policy, legislation, at the local, state, national, international level which we called the Whole Policy Approach which examined existing policies, their impact on practice and the changes needed. The Whole Rights Approach describes the Rights Group that focused on moving away from service delivery to the matter of rights and entitlements.
Shift in Ideology

• Inclusion means not only disabled children but also other children in our context amongst the poorer segments of society who face barriers to learning.
  ✓ The girl child
  ✓ The socially and economically disadvantaged child
  ✓ The child with disabilities
Making Special Schools Inclusive
Municipal School, Dharavi

A helping hand in a school run by Municipal Corporation
Making ordinary schools inclusive
Transforming the Community
The whole community approach
Key Principles

• **An Ecological inventory** is designed by listing all the common activities, materials used by children in a particular environment....What they touch, smell, feel, see, what are the activities they are attracted to.... From this a context specific curriculum is drawn up which is culture specific to their social mores. From this emerges an ecologically appropriate curriculum. An ecological appropriate curriculum provides a holistic approach within the framework of connecting knowledge to life outside the school.

• **Differentiated curriculum**... which allows content, activity and products to be differentiated according to each child’s needs, bearing in mind that each child learns at a different pace. Each child learns at a different pace by keeping pace with his or her ability. Differentiation of each child’s needs makes the learning and teaching flexible.
• **Multiple ability teaching**... which means teaching of groups of children with different abilities. This kind of teaching is especially advantageous for children at risk of dropping out as well as children with special needs.

• **Multiple intelligence**... There is increasing understanding on the part of educators and researchers of the importance of all of these intelligences for a child’s development and academic success. Opportunities for children to express themselves in multiple media - visual art, music, drama, dance - this is particularly important for children from linguistically and culturally diverse backgrounds.
Learning styles... perhaps the most vital development in education today. Learning styles definitely calls for learner centered approach to teaching. We all may need different strategies, and bring different gifts to the table of learning, but the quality and the style of our learning is not less because we learn differently than does someone else.

Community involvement... creating a community of learners, in which all members see themselves as both teachers, and learners, enables children, teachers, and parents to develop shared understandings about what is important to know and why it is important.
**Key Principles**

- **Cooperative and Collaborative Learning**: collaboration with other teachers and relevant staff for support to meet the individual needs of the students is important. Teachers, parents, and others can collaborate in determining and meeting the needs of any student.

- **Least Restrictive Environment**: students with special needs spend their leisure time in heterogeneous environments in the community. If they are to develop skills to function in that community, they may need to spend as much time as possible in regular school setting.
The success of inclusion depends on providing attention to the three forms of integration which are locational, social and functional.

- **Locational Factors:** All spaces in school, which are used by students, must be fully accessible to disabled students. This means that disabled students should be able to avail of the common facilities such as toilets, playground, laboratories, library, etc. independently.

- **Social Factors:** Inclusion means equal opportunities in social activities. Children with disabilities must be provided full access to extra curricular activities, social functions, competitions, sports, picnics, and other non-academic school activities. This helps in ending segregation and builds healthy interpersonal relationships between disabled students and their peer groups.

- **Functional:** Children with disabilities must be able to participate fully in all functional activities. Curriculum must be specially adapted for them. Suitable aids and appliances must be provided to facilitate full participation.
Inclusive Education

- Requires Reculturation of schools through:
  - Creating Inclusive Cultures,
  - Producing Inclusive Policies and
  - Evolving Inclusive Practices
The Three D's developed

1. **Demystification** of disability was carried out through sharing of information and techniques with parents, families and teachers.

2. **Deinstitutionalisation** involved moving away from specialised settings to community settings.

3. **Decentralisation** of services was possible due to training programmes and alliances.
The 3 new 'Rs' for Deprofessionlization

- **Retraining**
  
  .. into a new context and culture of the Community.

- **Relocation**
  
  ... away from the Institutional-base to the Community
  meant developing more community based initiatives.

- **Redeployment of time**
  
  ... several jobs were changed and another set of priorities
  was introduced
'I am the Professional': a deprofessionalisation exercise

'I know the problem of the special child' 'I am the professional' 'I will tell you how to go about it'.
Deinstitutionalisation

Resource Support to the Parents

through mahila mandals (PTAs) we tell them about nutrition and hygiene
Demystification

Mithu Alur & Jennifer Evans at one of our Anganwadis
Demolish a few myths

Myth that Anganwadi workers will not be able to take proper care of disabled children

Myth that Inclusion has to have a continuous support of well-resourced specialist services

Myth that inclusion is only for rich countries

Myth that disabled children are infectious
Entrenchment...
Therefore we broke the

Entrenchment... you need special schools only for disabled children

Entrenchment... teachers have to have a highly technical programme for inclusive education to happen

Entrenchment... that it needs vast resources for inclusion to happen and that there are vast numbers of disabled children hidden out there waiting to consume all the resources.
Culturally Appropriate Policy and Practice (CAPP)
Culturally Appropriate Policy and Practice (CAPP) - III
The Whole School Approach

1. School Head Supporting Staff
2. Teachers Supporting Teacher
3. Children Supporting Children
4. Families Supporting Families
Barriers
Looking at barriers that still exist...

- A major barrier coming in the way of inclusion on a macro level is structural and has got institutionalized. There are still two ministries addressing school needs of disabled children, the Ministry of SJE and the Ministry of HRD. The different agenda of these two Ministries causes a systems’ failure.

- The entire failure in the delivery system leaving millions out.

- The NGOs remain fragmented due to various factors. A sense of insecurity about their funding position: a NGO/Government nexus since Government gives them the grants to continue their work.
Looking at general teacher training courses, both Ministries run courses causing confusion. The Social Justice Ministry tinkers with teacher training through creating a cadre of people who are creating institutional barriers. Some amount of specialization is required but the technical mystification being perpetuated is detrimental. We have failed our children until special education is removed from Ministry of Social Justice to Ministry of Human Resource Development.

Lack of adequate number of training centers - There are very few training centers that teach students about disability and how disabled students can be included into mainstream education.

Lack of appropriate courses - There is also a severe dearth of appropriate courses for training on "How" to include all children into mainstream schools.
Recommendations
Pedagogy and Training - Putting Inclusive Principles in Teacher Training

- Pedagogy and training especially of the regular teachers are imperative for Inclusive Education to happen. This has to be with a resource support team from the special education to ensure retention of children in schools. NGO’s and special schools could play an important role as Resource Support Teams.

- The Teacher Training Courses at all levels also need to emphasize the study of disability and not let it be treated as an optional subject. The Principles of Inclusive Education need to be put into all training.
**Recommendations**

- **ICDS:** Every training programme for pre-school education should have a component on inclusive education. The duration of the training programme for Anganwadi workers should be increased from the present 28 days as disability is given short shrift. Refresher courses also to be held.

- “Students of today are the ‘teachers’ of tomorrow” - so the curriculum of all levels should have a component on disability. The curriculum should include information on all disabilities to enable teachers to teach all children. Not less than 10% of the curriculum should deal with disabilities. All levels of teachers training should include a paper on disability and sensitization.
Recommendations

- What is required is the Reculturation of schools through:
  - Creating Inclusive Cultures,
  - Producing Inclusive Policies and
  - Evolving Inclusive Practices

- The Ministry of Social Justice and Empowerment needs to play a critical role in transformation of existing Ministries. National Institutes Special Schools. Since they have the much needed expertise about children and youth with special needs, it is important for them in playing a key role in the process of change. A valuable role can be played by them in areas of treatment and rehabilitation and support in aids and devices.

- RCI approved course for registered teachers need to be revised and included in the Ministry of HRD.
Recommendations

• Special schools can become Resource Centres as well as Model Demonstration Hubs to actually demonstrate inclusive within each context engaging with Government’s existing programmes. These Model Demonstrative Centres of Inclusive Education can be scaled out all over the country.

• Higher Education should like other countries across the world include a special subject of Disability Studies which should move away from the current medical entrenchment of dysfunctioning individual to the social model of an enabling environment.

• The MHRD’s findings on integrated education in 25 polytechnics across the country needs to be disseminated to all of the concerned institutions and the lessons learnt therein should be incorporated in the new initiatives to be taken.