The Inter-agency Network for Education in Emergencies (INEE) is a global open network of members who are working together within a humanitarian and development framework to ensure that all individuals have the right to a quality, safe, relevant, and equitable education. INEE's work is founded on the fundamental right to education. For more information and to join INEE, visit inee.org.

Published by
Inter-agency Network for Education in Emergencies (INEE)
c/o International Rescue Committee
122 East 42nd Street, 12th floor
New York, NY 10168
United States
www.inee.org
INEE © 2022

License:
This document is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-ShareAlike 4.0. It is attributed to the Inter-agency Network for Education in Emergencies (INEE).

Suggested citation:

Cover Image:
Basic Numeracy and Literacy session in Sierra Leone, 2021 © Michael Duff, IRC
Acknowledgements

This second compilation of case studies detailing promising practices in teacher well-being, teacher management, and school leadership was a truly collaborative effort. Numerous individuals from academia and civil society have dedicated considerable time and effort to select, review, and prepare the case studies in this publication.

First and foremost, the members of the Teachers in Crisis Contexts Case Studies Committee, Mary Mendenhall, Danielle Falk, Paul Frisoli, and Jeffery Dow all contributed to case study reviews and were pivotal in providing the vision for this compilation. They also helped authors prepare their drafts for publication and copyedited final drafts, with support from Richaa Hoysala, Michael McCarville, Jade Sheinwald, and Taylor Schulte of Teachers College, Columbia University. Jihae Cha and Andrew Armstrong were instrumental in organizing the call for case studies, communications, and coordinating the entire process from start to finish. Chris Henderson and Charlotte Berquin, the co-chairs of the INEE TiCC Case Studies Committee, oversaw the development of this publication from start to finish.

The support and guidance of the Teachers in Crisis Contexts Event Series partner organizations is also greatly appreciated, including LEGO Foundation, UNESCO, Oxfam, Education International, and the European Union.

Design provided by 2D Studio.
# Contents

Acknowledgements .......................................................................................... 3

Foreword ........................................................................................................... 6

1: Case Studies on Teacher Well-being ............................................................ 8

1.1 Ethnic Identity and self-esteem development among young adult refugee Teachers in Greece: A Collaborative Teaching Model .................................. 9

1.2 Promising practices in teacher professional development in Uganda and South Sudan .............................................................. 13

1.3 How do we know if teachers are well? Developing and evaluating the psychometric properties of a teacher well-being questionnaire using a sample of El Salvadoran teachers .................. 19

1.4 ‘Supporting the Supporters’: Refugee teachers and teachers living in protracted conflicts ................................................................. 22

1.5 Developing teachers’ abilities to create trauma-informed classrooms and teach psychological resilience-building using cognitive behavioral approaches in Mindanao, Philippines. .................. 26

1.6 “Social emotional development for teachers”: An innovative program to improve teacher well-being in El Salvador ........................................... 30

1.7 In their words: Teacher well-being amidst displacement and fragility in Uganda and South Sudan ................................................................. 34

1.8 Coaching-observing-reflecting-engaging (CORE) for teachers: A well-being and support intervention for teachers ....................................... 38

1.9 Refugee teachers in Lebanon: The challenges of managing professional expectations with personal experiences ................................................. 42
2: Case Studies on Teacher Management

2.1 The challenges of equitable community teacher stipends in conflict affected areas of Myanmar

2.2 What promising strategies exist for the management of primary level teachers in refugee hosting areas in Kenya and where are there potential areas for further development?

2.3 Djibouti Declaration on Education for Refugees, Returnees and Host Communities: Lessons from policy responses of regional institutions in East Africa

2.4 What policies and implementation strategies exist for the effective management of teachers in refugee contexts in Ethiopia?

2.5 A systemic approach to teacher development – the UNRWA way

2.6 Addressing teacher shortages in conflict-affected Kachin State, Myanmar: A Comprehensive training approach for community teachers

2.7 Stripping away the packaging: Continuous teacher professional development for scale and integration in Lebanon

2.8 Moving teachers to Malawi’s remote communities: A data-driven approach to teacher deployment

3: Case Studies on School Leadership

3.1 Gender sensitized teacher leads transformative change for Meo Muslim girls during India’s COVID-19 school lockdowns.

3.2 Learning from school leaders in crisis contexts: A case study of Kakuma refugee camp and Kalobeyei settlement
When we edited the first edition of case studies, our attention was anchored by the reality that each year the education of an estimated 65 million students globally was disrupted by protracted conflict or sudden onset disaster.¹ For these students, teachers were central to educational quality and continuity and all that formal and non-formal schooling promises. Just six months later, as the COVID-19 pandemic wreaked havoc on education systems worldwide, it was estimated that as many as 1.6 billion students and 100 million teachers could no longer access physical classrooms or continuous learning.²

With disorienting immediacy, teachers were forced to adapt to new ways of working, adjusting their pedagogies for the realities of remote learning. For some, this meant a switch to online learning. Others supported learning through phone-based activities, supplementing low-tech radio and broadcast television lessons. For a vast majority, however, it meant preparing and delivering no-tech learning packages to students over vast distances, all the while navigating health risks or conflicts that COVID-19 failed to slow. COVID-19 has thus reinforced the under-addressed fact that teachers have always been leading at the frontline of humanitarian emergencies.³ ⁴

Before the pandemic, we promoted evidence showing that skilled teachers are the strongest school-level predictor of student learning.⁵ We also emphasized the relationship between teacher well-being and students’ social and emotional development.⁶ While such facts remain true, COVID-19 has helped us recognize how the instrumentalization of teachers for student development and well-being is insufficient. As a population affected by and working at the frontlines of humanitarian emergencies, teachers require our urgent attention and investment as an end unto itself.⁷ ⁸

Unresolved tensions in Tigray, the re-ascendence of the Taliban in Afghanistan, the disastrous rise of jihadism in the Sahel, and the continuing exodus of migrants from Central America’s gang-affected contexts continue to challenge governments and humanitarian agencies alike. Calamitous developments in Ukraine are overstretching systems already struggling to provide basic education and psycho-social support to millions of refugees, internally displaced or stateless learners. In these contexts, and far too many more, teachers bear the burden of student well-being and development, contending with working conditions that are rarely conducive to their own.

Thus, in a complex constellation of social, political, and environmental emergencies, never before has the need for effective teacher management, professional development, well-being, or school leadership support been so profound. That is why this compilation case studies is a timely and urgent resource for humanitarian practitioners, government policy makers, and donors alike.

To ensure readability and accessibility, especially in contexts with low connectivity, we have divided the case studies between two thematic publications:

- **Promising Practices in Teacher Professional Development**
- **Promising Practices in Teacher Well-being, Management, and School Leadership**

Across both, eighteen new case studies, alongside twenty-four from the first edition, provide an inspiring and innovative range of strategies that support teachers to achieve all they aspire for: for themselves, and for their learners.

Chrystal White’s case study from Myanmar shows us how, through an innovative stipend model, community teachers are attracted to and retained in the classroom. In Lebanon, Mai Abu Moghli shows how a burgeoning online community of practice among host community and refugee teachers informed a new teacher professional development initiative on the Edraak platform. Munia Islam Mozumder also illustrates how a large-scale teacher professional development initiative in Cox’s Bazar, Bangladesh, had to pivot and cascade a low-tech and no-tech delivery model for over 8,000 teachers in the midst of COVID-19.

This year, we also include school leadership as a thematic focus. From Kakuma refugee camp and Kalobeyei settlement in northwest Kenya, Dr. Mary Mendenhall, Danielle Falk, Jonathan Kwok, and Emily Ervin define the vast and diverse responsibilities of school leaders in crisis contexts. Their insights shed light on the support that school leaders need so that teachers are adequately supported, too. Seema Rajput has also contributed a school leadership case study, emphasizing a perspective of social justice leadership for gender equity and inclusion in Haryana State, India. There, decentralized leadership and community learning centers ensured learning continuity for otherwise marginalized students at the height of the pandemic.

These are just a few of the forty-two high-quality case studies on offer in this compilation. As you engage with those most relevant to your context, work, or needs, we hope your own efforts are affirmed and that new insights are gained, informing better ways of working with and for teachers in crisis contexts everywhere.

Thank you for your interest in and support for our work. The Inter-agency Network for Education in Emergencies (INEE) Teachers in Crisis Contexts (TiCC) Collaborative consists of a committed group of volunteers, each a champion for the work and well-being of teachers in their own right.

As we work towards better policies and practices for all teachers at this profound point of time, we are grateful to our donors, who are like-minded and passionate advocates for teachers and without whom this work would not be possible.

**Chris Henderson and Charlotte Berquin**  
Editors and Co-Chairs, INEE TiCC Case Study Committee
1: Case Studies on Teacher Well-being
1.1 Ethnic Identity and self-esteem development among young adult refugee teachers in Greece: A Collaborative Teaching Model

Organizations
Stanford University, Open-Cultural Center (OCC)

Authors
Zainab Hosseini, Maria Serra

Location
Polykastro, Greece

Teacher Profile
Refugee teachers

Topic
Teacher well-being

Description of Crisis-Specific Challenge

Identity development and self-esteem are considered fundamental developmental milestones (Erikson, 1968) associated with other indicators of psychological well-being (Umaña-Taylor & Updegraff, 2007). Refugee young adults face ongoing challenges to their ethnic identity and SE development as they reconcile separation from their places of origin with the new task of assimilating into new socio-cultural environments.

The Open Cultural Centre's (OCC) collaborative teaching model recruits local refugee YAs to co-teach alongside other YAs from across Europe. This group of YA teachers spend a considerable amount of time building rapport and pedagogical knowledge together and creating a diverse cohort of teachers, with the goal of providing educational opportunities to the local refugee community. This model empowers YA refugees to fulfill two of their identity and SE based psychological needs: individuation and attachment (Brewer, 1991). On the one hand, refugee teachers fulfill their need for feeling ethnically unique and proud through their role as cultural informants to the European teachers. On the other hand, refugee teachers experience a deep sense of connection with their European counterparts, fulfilling their need for belonging. These two components go hand in hand to foster a healthy ethnic identity and SE development whereby the YAs are able to balance feeling positive regard (Sellers, 1998) towards their own ethnic group while successfully integrating with the ethnic majority group.

In light of the socio-politically conservative environment in Polykastro, Greece, the concept of social cohesion and integration are contentious. While the common rhetoric among NGOs operating in Greece has been to promote the social integration of refugees into the fabric of society, as evidenced by ongoing collaborative meetings between organisations that are literally referred to as integration meetings, neither local nor refugee populations see integration as a priority. Polykastro residents have been noticeably unresponsive to participating in the events planned by the integration meetings, e.g., soccer tournaments, community conversations, etc., often as a result of opposing the very presence of the refugees. The refugees, on the other hand, often consider Greece as a transitional location from which they will leave, minimising the extent to which they are willing to sacrifice to interact with the unwelcoming locals. While the OCC’s collaborative teaching model may in fact serve as a pathway to facilitating the integration of the YA refugees locally, the primary outlook of the model is to facilitate their ability to integrate with a broader European context. That is, the YAs primarily learn to develop a sense of social integration with the larger European community, especially considering their long-term goals of resettling to other parts of Europe.
**Brief Overview**

The Nea Kavala camp is located 6 km outside of Polykastro, a town in the northern part of Greece near the Macedonian border. Approximately 2,000 refugees live inside of the camp, with another 250 members resettled inside of Polykastro. Over half of the current population is Afghan (55%), followed by Syrians (16%) and other ethnicities including Somalians and Congolese. 22% of the camp residents are women, 39% children, and 39% men.

The OCC teaching team is composed of 20 YAs, half of whom are local refugee YAs who have previously attended OCC programming while the other half are recruited from across Europe. European teachers can opt for a short (2 months) or a long-term (10 months) period, and local refugees do not have a time constraint. The teacher training program’s primary target population is refugee YAs, with a secondary target being the rest of the local refugee community.

The objectives of the OCC collaborative teaching model is twofold. First, the partnership between the refugee and European teachers empowers the refugee teachers to serve as linguistic and cultural bridges between the rest of the OCC team and the refugee community. The refugee teachers provide rich and invaluable information about the community’s needs, challenges, and expectations. Second, the partnership provides an opportunity for the refugee teachers to build meaningful professional and interpersonal relationships within a safe and socio-culturally diverse group. In addition to gaining technical knowledge from their counterparts, the actively multicultural environment of the teaching team often leads the refugee YAs to critically explore and strengthen their own self-concepts. The leadership is intentional around maintaining a balance between the teachers’ identities as cultural informants and their need to define their ethnic identity with agency.

The teaching team is divided into sub-teams who lead OCC’s various psychoeducational activities, including adult literacy courses and children’s English activities, etc. Each sub-team takes charge of planning, implementing, and evaluating the specific program they lead, facilitating a rich cultural and knowledge exchange environment. In addition to their professional collaboration, the teachers share living spaces, engage in leisurely activities, and break bread every Monday where one sub-team cooks for the rest of the team.

**Evidence and Outcomes**

The OCC collaborative teaching model has had three primary outcomes on refugee YAs. We gleaned these outcomes from semi-structured qualitative interviews with the YAs participating in this program, as well as field observations. Field observation notes and qualitative data were coded for themes covering the impact of participation in the program.

First, refugee YAs noted that the most impactful aspect of participation in the program was their sense of belonging. Participants noted that collaborating with a team of multicultural professionals enabled them to experience a sense of purposeful group attachment where they could problem-solve with people from a variety of backgrounds. One female teacher noted that “consuming each other’s ideas in a friendly atmosphere” was what enabled her to feel like a true member of the team.

Second, the YAs expressed that the ability to co-teach with people who have higher levels of education and professional backgrounds has increased their sense of self-esteem and self-efficacy. In the initial stages of training as a teacher, refugee YAs often felt high levels of stereotype threat and anxiety about their ability to perform in professional settings among other trained teachers. However, in addition to building pedagogical knowledge over time, the YAs slowly strengthened their beliefs in the assets they brought to the team, most importantly as cultural and linguistic bridges between the staff and refugee populations. Their unique contributions to the team were augmented by the fact that they were often consistent team members, which was juxtaposed with the European teachers who would
transition in and out of the team within months. Their ongoing role within the teaching team therefore conferred valuable knowledge that they could later share with the new incoming teachers, contributing to an overall sense of self-efficacy as a member of the OCC team.

Third, the refugee teachers unanimously agreed that most European teachers and OCC staff genuinely expressed interest and open-mindedness towards their cultural values and beliefs, and the overall team environment was one of equity and humanity. This, they noted, often led them to feel secure in sharing about who they are without experiencing stereotype threat, which in turn bolstered their sense of self as members of their own ethnic background without fearing prejudice. One young woman noted that the accepting environment encouraged her to be the “courage for Afghan women to be a part of it,” alluding to her desire for uplifting other Afghan women to partake in OCC (and other) activities.

The aforementioned outcomes can be categorised as more short-term, immediate, and tangible. A discussion of more long-term outcomes, such as the impact of the programs on the refugees’ career aspirations, is difficult because this population of YAs often avoids thinking about and/or speaking of long-term plans. The extremely unpredictable nature of their lives often prevents them from being as expressive as their non-refugee peers about their future wishes, making it difficult to ascertain whether the OCC collaborative model influences the career paths they may have in mind. Instead, the refugee YAs typically express interests in serving as translators and cultural brokers, which are tangible and accessible aspirations even in light of their current circumstances.

In addition to benefits for refugee YAs, the setup also has advantages for the European volunteer teachers. Most notably, volunteers are able to fulfil their interests in learning to navigate multicultural settings with individuals from different worldviews. These volunteers have often been socialised in academic environments in which particular western views are canonised, which leads them to search for more diverse perspectives and approaches to life. The opportunity to engage with YA refugee teachers as teammates is an invaluable unique experience through which European volunteer teachers can exercise cultural humility and expand their repertoire of knowledge.

**Limitations, Challenges, and/or Lessons Learned**

The strength of this program model comes from the strong interpersonal bonds between the diverse groups of teachers. While this approach has been a rich source of psychological development, it has also included challenges.

The emotional bonds cultivated by European teachers are often cut short when they leave. In some cases, friendships and romantic relationships may be cut short, which can be a psychosocial stressor for the YA refugees. This is especially the case in light of the refugees’ past experiences with loss of attachments and trauma.

Additionally, and especially when relationships are of a sexual nature, potential disparate notions of romantic relationship can exist whereby some local refugees expect long-term serious relations while some Europeans understand the encounters to be temporary. In such cases both individuals can experience hurt and pain, especially when misconceptions regarding interpersonal boundaries arise.

These relationships are often not public and accounts of them are anecdotal, making it difficult to quantify how common they are. However, OCC staff estimate that there may be 4 or 5 instances throughout the year. It bears mentioning that all volunteers sign official codes of conduct that forbid such intimate relationships between volunteers, and European volunteers participate in trainings that raise awareness about the ethical issues involved in the power imbalance that permeates these interactions. One possible future intervention stemming from the field of social psychology may involve enlisting seasoned peer volunteers who can informally dissuade such interactions from occurring.


1.2 Promising practices in teacher professional development in Uganda and South Sudan

Organizations
AVSI, Columbia Global Centers, Community Development Initiative, Education International (EI), Forum for African Women Educationalists in Uganda (FAWEU), Luigi Giussani Institute of Higher Education, Oxfam, Uganda National Teachers’ Union (UNATU)

Author
Lotte Ladegaard

Locations
Palabek, Uganda, and Torit, Kapoeta, and Juba, South Sudan

Teacher Profiles
Teachers in crisis contexts in IDP and refugee settlements as well as host communities

Topic
Teacher well-being

Description of Crisis-Specific Challenge

Almost 2.2 million South Sudanese refugees are seeking asylum in neighbouring countries, such as Uganda, which hosts an estimated 921,013 refugees (UNHCR, 2021a; UNHCR, 2021b.) Within South Sudan, 1.62 million people are internally displaced (ReliefWeb, 2021). Additionally, South Sudan received 388,000 spontaneous refugee returnees in April 2021 (UNHCR, 2021b).

More than half of the world’s refugees are children and adolescents and their access to education is crucial to the sustainable development of the host countries and to their home countries when they return (UNHCR, 2019). Yet only 68 per cent of all refugee children attend primary school (UNHCR, 2021).

Among the root causes of the displacement are violence, food insecurity, loss of security and the lack of basic services, and affected populations commonly experience long term displacement while host communities must find ways of accommodating refugees and IDPs in their contexts.

Displaced children and youth risk missing out on any education if we do not support and strengthen the education system to meet their needs.

Along with the stigma often attached of being a refugee or an IDP learner, displaced children and youth are also challenged by the language of instruction, and the culture in their new community. Many of them have missed out on years of education or have had no opportunity at all to enrol in primary school. Female students face another barrier with many becoming pregnant before completing their education.

In crisis situations, teachers are typically unprepared to address the needs of refugee and IDP learners (Oxfam, n.d.). Displaced learners are commonly older than learners in the host communities, they often need psychosocial support, and are faced with navigating a new education system. All of this requires teachers to have a range of multiple competencies.

The Education for Life project provides second chance education through accelerated education programmes (AEP/ALP) for adolescents and youth in Uganda and South Sudan. A key element of the project is to strengthen the education systems by providing continued teacher professional development (TEPD).

This case study is based on research conducted from June to July 2021, which included online focus group discussions with representatives of all partners and a few teachers, as well as a learner from the implementing organisations.

---

1 AEP/ALP are flexible, age-appropriate programmes run in an accelerated time frame. Their aim is to provide access to education for disadvantaged, over-age, out-of-school children, and youth – particularly those who missed out on, or had their education interrupted due to poverty, marginalisation, conflict, and crisis (UNHCR, n.d.)
Brief Overview

Drawing on the Inter Agency Network for Education in Emergencies Teachers in Crisis Contexts (TiCC) Training for Primary School Teachers, the TEPD package is led by Luigi Giussani Institute for Higher Education in partnership with UNATU (adaptation of the module on Teacher’s Role and Well-being) and FAWEU (Child Protection, Well-being, and Inclusion) as well as other implementing partners (AVSI, CDI, Oxfam) in four project areas. The consortium partners follow the national education policies and frameworks in their respective countries.

Through the Education for Life project, we adapted the TiCC package to the specific needs of teachers and learners in the crisis affected environments of Uganda and South Sudan. The TEPD centres offer a mixed methods approach and continuous support and engagement with teachers; among the activities are trainings, Teacher Learning Circles (TLCs), and classroom visitations/observations among teachers as outlined in the TiCC Peer Coaching materials.

Implementing partners and local stakeholders, including governments, district education officials, trainers of local primary teacher colleges, and teachers have taken part in the development of the TEPD package.

The process was also informed by a teacher needs assessment carried out in Uganda in 2018 in the settlement area and a desk review of relevant documentation in South Sudan.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TEPD modules</th>
<th>Contents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction of Core Principles</td>
<td>• A critical appraisal of the common concept of education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• The awareness of the importance of the educator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher’s Role and Well-being</td>
<td>• The role of teachers in the school and in the community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Code of Conduct</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Teachers’ well-being and stress management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Collaboration and communities of practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child Protection, Well-being, and Inclusion</td>
<td>• Introduction to child Protection and child rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Creating a safe space</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Inclusive classroom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Gender responsive pedagogy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Sexual maturation and reproductive health rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Teaching life skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Seeking further support for children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pedagogy</td>
<td>• Child development and differentiation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Classroom management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Active and engagement learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Questioning strategies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curriculum and Planning</td>
<td>• Using curriculum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Long term planning and learning Objectives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Lessons planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Making lessons relevant and meaningful</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Assessment</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Evidence and Outcomes

Applying a training of trainers (ToT) approach, the TEPD is offered to accelerated learning/education programme (ALP/AEP) teachers as well as formal primary school teachers in 24 schools in Lamwo District, Uganda, and 18 schools in Torit, Kapoeta, and Juba, South Sudan. As part of the conflict sensitive approach, AEP/ALP centres are hosted by a formal primary school.

The teacher trainers are part of government structures. When the teacher trainers’ capacity is built upon, they may reinforce other teachers’ training activities and thereby, over time strengthen the national education system.

From the project’s initiation in 2018 until June 2021, 420 teachers in Uganda and 357 teachers in South Sudan have taken part in TEPD (Oxfam, 2021). However, not all teachers have participated in all modules as trained teachers in the formal schools are regularly redeployed. The aim is to train 350 teachers in all modules in Uganda and 315 in South Sudan (Oxfam, 2021a). We will reach this target by the end of the project.

Most of the trained teachers are national teachers but, in both Uganda, and South Sudan a few of the teachers are from South Sudan and Uganda respectively. South Sudanese nationals need to be registered teachers with the Ministry of Education and Sport in order to teach in Ugandan schools. These teachers have completed their formal teacher training in Uganda.

TEPD and Teacher Learning Circles (TLCs) seem to be popular, especially where teachers who did not attend the trainings have requested to participate in TEPD/TLCs as they see the benefits. Teachers learn from their peers, and they support each other, for example, by learning how to use different pedagogical practices and approaches by observing their peers’ lessons.

The project introduces teacher trainers to TLCs and trains them in how to support the implementation of TLCs. We roll out this training to teachers by the teacher trainers. In each school, teachers identify a peer coach who is responsible for organising the TLCs. The peer coach is linked up with a teacher trainer to ensure that teachers are supported in the roll out of TLCs.

The teachers also use classroom visitations and peer supervision, which involves a teacher sitting at the back of the classroom observing a peers’ areas of strength and areas for improvement (Education for Life – TEPD Working group, n.d. p. 17-18). The aim is for the observing teacher to learn and to provide feed-back to the teacher conducting teaching. This possibility is open to all teachers but requires a certain level of mutual trust, maturity and confidence.

Due to continuous follow-up and tracking of teachers’ performance through post training assessments, results suggest that most of the trained teachers are able to apply the learnings from the training in the classrooms (Oxfam, 2021b). However, the project’s midterm review indicates that although some teachers were able to apply participatory methods, most teachers require more support. The project is working on ways to improve this.

According to partners and teachers interviewed as part of the research for this case study, the trained teachers seem to have increased their capacity to plan lessons and scheme their work in alignment with the national curriculum and syllabus. Project teachers appear to have adopted learner-centred methods and improved the classroom management, where corporal punishment seems to have been substituted with positive discipline and respect instead of fear. Project teachers seem to now be more aware of how language may stigmatise learners. They indicate that it is important not to categorise learners as “refugee children” and “host children.” A learner is a learner.

We have embedded gender mainstreaming in the project and in all parts of the TEPD, including the training, TLCs, and classroom observations, aimed to have a positive impact on the teachers’ gender perceptions and actions. Project teachers seem to be more aware of how they address gender issues and challenge negative gender norms. For example, they no longer repeat statements such as “this is for boys” and “girls are not good at math,” according to partners. This was confirmed by the midterm review.
Seating arrangements and inclusive teaching methodologies ensure that female learners are paid as much attention as their male peers, and the training seems to have enabled project teachers to better respond to both girls and boys. 97 percent of the female learners in candidate classes sat for the primary leaving exam, which is a potential indicator of the project’s success.

The TEPD package may have also increased project teachers’ understanding of their own well-being, including signs of stress. Self-care skills impact the teaching positively, as a thriving teacher is a better teacher. When teachers understand and embrace their own physical and psychological well-being, as well as reactions, they are better able to recognise and understand their learners’ emotions, actions, and subsequently counsel and support them.

We also train teachers in the project in psycho-social support, including how to accompany the learners, to support learners to keep them in school, and to focus on the value of education. This work is related to broader school governance and community work with teachers being an incredibly important player in this regard. At times, teachers in the project took on roles as para social workers.

Through collaboration and by using their new skills from the TEPD package, project teachers seem to more easily find solutions to challenges in their professional and private lives, as well as in their communities. Combined, this potentially gives project teachers a sense of belonging. This may also explain why very few teachers in the supported AEP/ALP centres left their position during the COVID-19 pandemic, contrary to many other schools.

In response to the pandemic and school closures, the consortium implemented psychosocial support teacher training and an SMS-campaign to provide additional support to project teachers. The aim was to equip them with enough knowledge and skills to offer psychosocial support to their learners during school closures and reopenings. This training has now become part of the TEPD training materials.

During the COVID-19 lockdown the teachers in Uganda have been supporting home-based learning using materials distributed by the National Curriculum Development Centre, and radio learning with guidance from teachers. Community leaders, parents, and learners have been supportive of this effort.

Subsequently, the project teachers in South Sudan developed their own home-based learning materials and arranged community learning groups for radio education backed by PTA members and community leaders and teachers. Project teachers’ ability to adapt to the new situation with support from the project may be an indication of increased teacher resilience.

The learnings from the TEPD package are reflected in the feedback from learners. They have noted changes and improvements in their teachers’ practice and performance. Learners report that their teachers seem to better understand their problems, provide support, and are able to comprehend their teaching. As a learner says: “I like the teachers. They are good; they know how we struggle with our lives, and they know how to give advice.”

Limitations, Challenges, and/or Lessons Learned

Challenges

- When formal schoolteachers are redeployed, some drop out of the TEPD before they have completed all modules. The redeployments also challenge the monitoring of the progress and impact of the training; when a teacher is redeployed outside the project areas the partners cannot follow up and new teachers need to be trained. Nevertheless, the project still finds that applying a continuous approach to TEPD is valuable.

- Security issues in South Sudan and COVID-19 have caused delays in the TEPD implementation. Project planning has taken place online, which is challenging with unstable internet connections. Partners have been unable to cross the border between the two countries, and in South Sudan it was difficult to support teachers living in remote areas. Many teachers were unable to participate in a TEPD training in March 2021. The project is now organising another training.
• The project approach and budget constraints are limitations per se as the training is not available to schools outside the project, although there are demands from schools beyond the project implementation areas, according to partners interviewed as a part of this case study.

Lessons learned
• Working with national governments to contextualise and approve the TEPD materials is an important, promising practice from the TEPD, although the collaboration has proven to cause some delays in both South Sudan and Uganda. A lesson learned is to build in time for these delays in the programme planning.
• In keeping with the project design, district education officers and primary teacher colleges are in charge of providing supervision to the trained teachers. This is important in terms of sustainability.
• TLCs are an integral element of the TEPD approach as they build on teacher’s lived experiences and create a community of teachers who can support each other in a sustainable way. It does however require that trust is built amongst teachers before they are willing to share their experiences and concerns, and a culture of learning needs to be established where bringing up challenges is welcomed. Substantial support is needed for this activity.
• It would have strengthened the TEPD implementation further if the ToT facilitators and tutors who are most familiar with the training contents were following up even more on how teachers are managing to bring the lessons from the training into the classroom.
• Spurred by COVID-19 and subsequent delays in the rollout of the teacher training, the partners decided to conduct an online ToT in South Sudan. The practical and technical challenges were substantial; all participants needed access to laptops and stable internet connections which were not readily available everywhere. The partners also realised that online ToT cannot stand alone. It needs to be supplemented by face-to-face training once possible.
• In retrospect, additional TEPD manuals readily available in the schools could have boosted the project implementation during the pandemic. For example, when some teachers in Uganda requested refresher training to support untrained colleagues, they did not have access to the TEPD manuals.
• A plan for how to support trained teachers in bringing back their learnings to other colleagues could also have further strengthened the implementation during the pandemic.

References

Oxfam (2021a). Consolidated Annual Data Collection_June_Final.xlsx. Oxfam

Oxfam (2021b). Resilient learners, teachers and education systems in South Sudan and Uganda year three annual narrative report 2021. Oxfam


UNHCR (2019). Refugee education in crisis: More than half of the world’s school-age refugee children do


UNHCR (n.d.). Accelerated Education. [https://www.unhcr.org/accelerated-education-working-group.html](https://www.unhcr.org/accelerated-education-working-group.html)

### Relevant Links

- **BRICE - Education for Life**
- **Education for life: Teachers in Uganda help vulnerable children to face lockdown and stay in school**
1.3 How do we know if teachers are well? Developing and evaluating the psychometric properties of a teacher well-being questionnaire using a sample of El Salvadoran teachers

**Organization**  
FHI360

**Authors**  
Fernanda Soares, Nina Cunha, and Paul Frisoli

**Location**  
El Salvador

**Teacher Profile**  
National teachers working in insecure settings

**Topic**  
Teacher well-being

**Description of Crisis-Specific Challenge**

To inform policy and advance research in low-income and conflict-affected contexts about teacher well-being, we need measurement tools that are not only reliable, valid, comparable, and feasible, but also contextually relevant. For education systems, school districts, and school-based leadership to adequately support teachers, they first need to know if teachers are well. Several measurement tools for teacher well-being with strong psychometric properties have been developed and validated in developed and more stable contexts, but we do not know if they are adequate for collecting information about teachers’ well-being in low-income and conflict-affected contexts. Oftentimes researchers and practitioners use measurement tools developed in the United States, England, Germany, and the Netherlands with little adaptation, raising questions over whether the content of the tool still captures the construct in a different context.

To advance in the study and understanding of teachers’ well-being in low-income and conflict-affected contexts, instruments to assess teachers’ well-being are needed. The purpose of this study is to develop, assess, and validate the psychometric properties of a teacher well-being questionnaire in El Salvador.

**Brief Overview**

El Salvador’s current high levels of gang-related violence has a direct impact on education. Around 65% of schools are affected by gang presence and 30% face internal security threats from gangs. (MINED 2015) In a Rapid Education and Risk Analysis conducted by USAID (2016), teachers said that they experienced stress from working in an environment of intimidation and feel in need of psychological support. The study also revealed that teachers feel overwhelmed and under-equipped to handle the emotional needs of students, who come to school burdened by violence, threats, and family difficulties. Teachers also reported feeling threatened and afraid to teach and discipline students who are, or are related to, gang members.

In light of the current issues, FHI360 is supporting the development of a teacher well-being measurement questionnaire, which will help meet the call for research and for an increased understanding of current levels of teacher well-being in El Salvador. As a first in this process, the research team conducted a literature review, which resulted in four key teacher well-being constructs identified: emotional regulation, emotional exhaustion, stress, and classroom management self-efficacy. The team then conducted an inventory of measurement tools available and selected the following scales to comprise the questionnaire: Emotional Regulation Questionnaire (Gross and John, 2003); Emotional Exhaustion Subscale of the Maslach Burnout Inventory-educators’ survey (Maslach, Jackson, and Leiter, 1997); Perceived Stress Scale (Cohen et al., 1983); and self-efficacy for classroom management subscale.
of the Ohio State Teacher Efficacy Scale (Tschannen-Moran and Woolfolk-Hoy, 2001). The questionnaire adaptation process consisted of two main phases: translation and cognitive interviews. First, the selected measures were translated from English to Spanish by one translator following the ITC Guidelines for Translating and Adapting Tests (International Test Commission, 2018). Two additional translators verified the translation to ensure that items in the different scales held similar meaning as in the English language. The translation is a critical step, as items must be translated well linguistically to maintain comparison of responses across cultures (Beaton et al., 2000) and to ensure they are capturing the underlying intended construct. In addition to a quality translation, items must also be adapted culturally to maintain content validity across different cultures (Ibid). As part of the adaptation process, the research team conducted cognitive interviews with a sample of 25 local El Salvadoran teachers. Through cognitive interviewing it is possible to verify if “respondents are able to understand the questions being asked, that questions are understood in the same way by all respondents, and that respondents are willing and able to answer such questions” (Collings, 2003, p.229). Cognitive interviews provide additional evidence of content validity by assessing if respondents understand the items in the same way as intended by the original instrument. Adaptations to the questionnaire were made based on the results from cognitive interviews.

Data were collected through a self-reported paper-based questionnaire from a sample of 1,653 primary and secondary local teachers. An exploratory factor analysis (EFA) was conducted separately for each of the 4 measures identified for the toolkit in order to determine if the questions linked to each of the constructs showed the expected pattern. To further investigate the psychometric properties of each construct we calculated means, standard deviations, reliability coefficients, and total item correlation. We also conducted a concurrent validity analysis.

**Evidence and Outcomes**

The psychometric assessment completed in this study suggested that the Spanish version of the different measures that comprise the well-being questionnaire have good content and construct validity. The internal reliability for the different scales is also acceptable. Thus, the teacher well-being toolkit can be used as a tool to measure teachers’ well-being in El Salvador. As a good practice, it is suggested that additional translations and validations be conducted in order to provide an enhanced tool to measure well-being across different cultures and to examine possible relationships between well-being and the implementation of additional teacher supports (both pre-service and in-service).

Descriptive statistics under this study demonstrate that teacher well-being is generally positive in El Salvador. Teachers do not experience high levels of emotional exhaustion at work or overall perceived stress and they tend to have a high level of confidence in their ability to manage disruptive behavior in the classroom. The statistics show that although teachers employ cognitive reappraisal strategies, suppression is also commonly used. This is concerning given that suppression has been associated with decreased well-being outcomes, such as depression and pessimism (Barsade and Gibson, 2007; Côté and Morgan, 2002).

The instrument also shows promise in aiding school administrators and practitioners in measuring teachers well-being in the El Salvadorian context. Administrators may find the instrument useful in determining teachers’ well-being as it relates to emotional regulation, perceived stress, emotional exhaustion, and classroom management self-efficacy. This information could be used by administrators to inform interventions, as well as measure the success of interventions. Additionally, the instrument could be used as a self-assessment tool by practitioners to highlight areas in which support, additional resources, and self-improvement can occur. Thus, future study in the utilization of the questionnaire is supported.
Limitations, Challenges, and/or Lessons Learned

One main limitation of this study is that it did not validate the teacher well-being measurement toolkit for program evaluation purposes. Further research is needed to determine if these tools are sensitive to program interventions of short duration and if they are able to detect change over time. Also, conducting a Confirmatory Factor Analysis (CFA) is highly recommended as a next step.

References


### Description of Crisis-Specific Challenge

The main crisis-specific challenge NRC seeks to address in their ‘supporting the supporters’ interventions under the Better Learning Program (BLP) programme is that children affected by crises in the Middle East and North Africa (MENA) region have heightened psychosocial support (PSS) and social and emotional learning (SEL) needs which are, largely, unmet by the existing education systems. As a result, there is demand for additional capacity building for teachers in both formal and non-formal education settings to address these needs:

- **Formal education in MoE/UNRWA schools in Palestine**: Formal school teachers who have limited professional support through the formal system and who are struggling with their own sense of well-being because of the protracted crisis and occupation;

- **Non-formal education programmes in refugee camps in Jordan**: Camp-resident staff who are well trained by NRC in SEL and PSS programming, but who have their own social, emotional, and well-being needs which are often unmet.

In both cases, ‘supporting the supporters’ mechanisms are needed to ensure adequate support for these educators, both in terms of professional development as well as building their capacity, resilience, and own well-being to be able to effectively meet the PSS needs of the children they work with.

### Brief Overview

NRC’s response to the above challenges over the past years has been to establish comprehensive ‘supporting the supporters’ components for the teachers in its BLP programming. The components include both professional capacity development opportunities, as well as mechanisms to address the well-being of the caregivers themselves. These components were created in response to:

- Results of NRC’s external evaluation of the BLP in 2016 (Shah 2016) which showed that NRC was not adequately caring for its careers (such as counselors, teachers, parents and master trainers);

- Regular structured feedback sessions carried out in After Action Reviews with staff through an internal counseling mechanism (explained further below), to tailor the specific support provided to PSS service delivery on its staff and partners as service providers;

- Hence, in 2017 and 2018, NRC started to pilot ‘supporting the supporters’ initiatives in Palestine and Jordan, in tandem with teacher professional development opportunities.
The non-formal education programme in Jordan instigated the following components:

• **Establishment of a Monitoring and Support Unit (MSU)** which acts as an internal counseling department for BLP and PSS staff composed of camp resident staff (Syrian refugees). The team is trained in child protection and PSS techniques and has the specific mandate to monitor child protection issues and to identify children who are in need of additional PSS support, including whether they need internal or external referral. The MSU also provides technical advice, workshops, and capacity building to other staff who deliver BLP to children to better be able to cope with emotional burdens.

• **Regular professional debriefing and learning sessions** with teachers as an opportunity for teachers to unload, debrief, and recover after PSS delivery.

• **Regular subject-specific capacity development opportunities** for BLP staff, with technical staff consistently following up.

• **Opportunities for personal/professional growth** for staff, including being able to move away from delivering PSS and BLP interventions if required, and opportunities to take on more roles of responsibility within the programme.

In Palestine, these initiatives have been implemented by specialised local partners, namely the Palestinian Counselling Centre (PCC) and the Gaza Community Mental Health Program (GCMHP). Partners were selected based on their local expertise in this field. A series of meetings with NRC took place to define the objective of the proposed intervention, the strategy, and the methodology. The intervention focused on the following components:

• **Capacity building focusing on self-awareness and regulation techniques to deal with stress** including breathing and relaxation exercises;

• **Expressive arts therapy** including writing, drama, dance, movement, painting, and music;

• **Recreational games** to improve well-being and reduce stress in open air settings;

• **Phone hotline** made available where qualified operators can refer counselling requests or provide online counselling services aiming at delving deeply into the major stressors affecting teachers personal and professional lives;

• **Provision of PSS materials** as part of a kit in tandem with capacity building to teaching and non-teaching staff to implement PSS related activities in schools.

**Evidence and Outcomes**

Providing PSS-based services to children in camps by guiding them through processes to deal with symptoms of trauma and distress, including sharing of horrible memories about war, can result in emotional and well-being burdens for the staff. Similarly, living under constant attacks in Gaza and violations of international humanitarian law (IHL) in West Bank, results in living constantly with high levels of stress. The main outcomes of integrating the ‘supporting the supporters’ mechanisms into the BLP include the following main results:

• **BLP teaching staff** overall, reported having an increased sense of personal resilience and well-being. Specifically, 74% (N=113) who were part of this initiative in West Bank reported that it was a source of support and 86% understood better the importance of practising self-care approaches in their personal and professional lives. 64% (N=57) in Gaza showed clear improvement in their ability to manage stress and 84% female teachers reported improvement in their daily work and in solving personal life problems. Overall, in Gaza, 76% reported having improved their work deliverables by becoming more accurate and more motivated (Shah 2016). In Jordan, it was reported that staff were coping better with the stress of living...
in camps: ‘I began practicing the content of BLP in my daily life. I started becoming calmer and my anger gradually faded away. I feel I’m a better teacher and person today. I have the knowledge and tools to change the way these children, and myself, view life. The students I work with continuously give me the motivation and encouragement to deal with my own problems’ (Shah 2017).

- **Camp-resident refugee staff** in Jordan, have grown professionally covering managerial positions in the NRC Learning Centres. They have been placed in charge of capacity development and performance of ten staff in each unit dealing with PSS support, outreach and community engagement, curriculum development, and quality control.

- **BLP service provision to children** suffering from trauma has strengthened as a result of having improved skills, practices, expertise, and motivation: ‘We are now able to understand why children are being very challenging and aggressive, we understand now how much they suffer and we were not considering that before’. In Jordan, data suggest that 80% of BLP students reported not having nightmares at all after the completion of the BLP individual sessions. A further 19% reported only having 1-2 nightmares per week (compared to on average 5 nights with nightmares/week at the start). A very small minority of students (less than 1%) continued to have 3 or more nightmares per week. Teachers reported stronger improvement on children’ well-being as a consequence of teachers having greater skills and improved well-being themselves (Shah 2016).

### Limitations, Challenges, and/or Lessons Learned

**Jordan**

- Camp-resident staff have their own traumas and social and emotional distress with few services in camps available.

- NRC camp resident staff (with a small number of exceptions approved by the Ministry of Interior) are not allowed to leave the camp. This limits the occasion for professional exchange.

- The camp management’s cash for work policy includes a staff rotation system which has been one of the main challenges exposing NRC to the risk of losing expertise. NRC has advocated to limit the rotation only to certain positions, excluding those staff who are engaged in PSS/child protection and education and should not be considered under a cash for work scheme.

- Displaced populations in camps were a great resource in the management of the crisis and during this post-crisis phase. Camp management policies should encourage the strategy of engaging with displaced populations from the early stage of a crisis.

**Palestine**

- Protracted conflict and intensity of attacks in Gaza and violation of IHL in West Bank raise the level of stress and hopelessness, limiting the abilities of teaching and non-teaching staff to completely recover.

- Based on the pilot carried out in Palestine, it was suggested to increase the number of capacity building/training activities in order to increase the level of support and consistent follow-up and to have this initiative institutionalized in MoE schools.
References


Relevant Links

- [End the Nightmares](#)
1.5 Developing teachers’ abilities to create trauma-informed classrooms and teach psychological resilience-building using cognitive behavioral approaches in Mindanao, Philippines.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Education Development Center</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Authors</td>
<td>Heidi Kar, Miriam Pahm, Alejandra Bonifaz, and Nicole Wallace</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Location</td>
<td>Mindanao, Philippines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher Profile</td>
<td>Host-community teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Topics</td>
<td>Teacher professional development, Teacher well-being</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Description of Crisis-Specific Challenge**

Mindanao, in the southern Philippines, has in recent years experienced increased conflict and instability, worsened by challenging economic conditions, mistrust in government, and wider geopolitical conflict. The 2017 siege of the city of Marawi by the Maute group, an affiliate of the Islamic State of Iraq and Syria (ISIS), led to the displacement of over 300,000 people before the Philippine military regained control.

Within this context, the USAID Mindanao Youth for Development (MYDev) project aimed to provide vulnerable youth who are no longer in school with opportunities to earn a living, contribute to their communities, build resilience to violence and violent extremist activities, and thus support peace and stability in the region. Working with a range of national, regional, and local government agencies as well as with local NGOs, private sector and community organizations, MYDev engaged over 22,000 youth in soft skills and technical training, employment, leadership, and community development activities, building their basic education competencies, livelihood capacities, and life and leadership skills. MYDev worked in close coordination with government ministries, private technical and vocational training (TVET) institutions, businesses, and local NGOs.

Out-of-school youth are exposed to high levels of family and community violence and are at increased risk for recruitment into violent extremist groups. Educators working with out-of-school youth, in particular, can benefit from learning basic, evidence-based cognitive-behavioral skills, both for their own coping skills and to enable them to help the youth they work with cope with adverse situations and develop resiliency for the future.

Educators live and work within the same difficult community dynamics and are exposed to the same violence, and as such, can also benefit from learning positive coping and resiliency skills for their own mental well-being. Educators who can better control their emotions and understand how to adopt more flexible thinking patterns will be able to control their anger and not act out in physically or emotionally violent ways against students.

Our theory of change is that educators who are able to understand their own mental health needs and who have been trained in evidence-based psychological approaches which support positive mental health can be effective educators of these skills for youth. In addition, educators who have been trained in how to promote positive mental health and coping skills will be more effective and functional educators. This project, therefore, sought to teach life skills facilitators, TVET instructors, and mobile teachers key foundational psychological skills to support both their own and their students’ mental and emotional health.
**Brief Overview**

A training-of-trainers program was developed to build educators' skills in trauma-informed, evidence-informed mental health interventions including positive coping skill activities and resilience-building approaches. Though much of the international community is focused on adapting Western psychological treatment manuals to conflict and post-conflict settings, too few are discussing the effectiveness of indigenizing foundational, evidence-based psychological approaches and theories of change to these contexts (e.g., Wendt, Marecek, & Goodman, 2014). In addition, while most focus resides in training lay community workers in psychosocial support, educators have an untapped role to play in building the resilience of the world’s youth. Though the project focused on educators in out-of-school systems, the approaches utilized are widely applicable to formal education systems. The curriculum is based on a combination of principles from cognitive-behavioral theory and incorporates an acceptance and commitment therapy orientation.

Cognitive-behavioral Theory (CBT) posits that our thoughts drive our emotional responses which, in turn, determine our behavior across all situations. As such, sustained changes in behavior demand that we change the ways we think about situations. CBT is the most well-researched, evidence-based psychological approach which has demonstrated efficacy in both preventing psychological disorders from forming and in treating psychological disorders (Daneil, Cristea, & Hofmann, 2018). Learning to change inflexible, rigid, and extreme thinking patterns is an essential aspect to rehabilitating violent perpetrators, treating post-traumatic stress disorder, and for treating depression and anxiety disorders. Acceptance and Commitment Therapy (ACT) is a specific CBT-orientation which helps human beings learn to differentiate between aspects of their life circumstance which they cannot control and those which they can. Individuals and communities who have experienced high levels of community violence and conflict will have experiences which, while difficult, need to be incorporated into their life story as opposed to being avoided. This acceptance of one’s experiences combined with healthy cognitive and behavioral coping skills garnered through a CBT-approach has been demonstrated to lead to individual and community healing (e.g., Ruiz, 2010).

An example of a CBT-based coping skill applied through an ACT lens is that of helping a youth adopt the perspective that, while it isn’t fair that their home was destroyed in the recent conflict, they can choose how they react to that reality. While they can continue to think only angry, revenge-focused thoughts, which may lead to intense anger and potential retaliation or joining of an extremist group, they have the choice of adopting a different perspective. They can choose thinking patterns that focus on finding ways to take more active roles in helping to make their community safer or in rebuilding the infrastructure of their community.

Evidence-based psychological principles were contextualized to the Filipino culture through in-depth testing of curriculum activities with educators and youth, incorporation of feedback on specific ways youth refer to certain feelings (i.e., hopeless vs. depressed) and the best ways to explain concepts, and focus on the specific issues that youth said were of greatest importance in their lives.

Utilizing a holistic, evidence-based approach to support peace and stability in conflict and crisis settings, the program was implemented across four regions within the south Philippines, some urban and some rural. Out-of-school settings ranged from a tent in the evacuation camps, to a room in the municipal buildings (for ALS classes), to more traditional classroom spaces.

This specific Resiliency Building Training-of-Trainers (ToT) curriculum entitled *Foundations of Resilience* module was developed to enhance awareness of one’s own mental health needs, vulnerabilities, and new psychological skills to support mental well-being. The curriculum has three main goals. The first goal is to raise awareness of the connection between thoughts, feelings, and behaviors and to reflect on how one’s thinking drives behavior across situations. Interactive exercises and self-reflective activities facilitate this foundational learning. The second goal of the module focuses on helping teachers and youth understand the concept of coping skills. Once we know how we feel (e.g., sad, angry, scared,
revengeful), we can then make the connection to the type of support and/or coping skills needed to think through the consequences of our actions. After learning how to both cope with negative feelings (including learning coping skills such as mindfulness and progressive muscle relaxation), teachers learn how to specifically address unhealthy thinking patterns and interrupt the warning signs that lead to aggression and violence. Finally, teachers are taught that in order to receive support from others, we need to know how to ask for the support we need.

Out-of-school youth who were enrolled in our accelerated, non-traditional educational program between the ages of 15 and 24 years old were included in the program. Following the initial TOT workshop, master trainers went on to train all teachers in the program in two-day workshops across the southern Philippines. Master trainers delivered the in-person workshops and remained available for questions or consultation while teachers delivered the 16-hour curriculum to their own students. Over the course of six months, over 50 educators were trained and in turn, trained 5,000 youth.

**Evidence and Outcomes**

Impact evaluation data suggest that participation in the resiliency module for youth beneficiaries led to improved decision making, changed views on the acceptability of violence, promoted greater consideration of consequences of actions prior to reacting, and improved ability to manage anger.

Qualitative focus group discussions (FGDs) were held with four groups of youth ($n=41$) and two groups of teachers ($n=16$). The FGDs were conducted in English with a Filipino translator. Participants included, as much as was possible, one young woman and one young man from each community and one teacher from each community in which the project operated. Both youth and teachers reported changes in thought processes and in behavior indicative of improved resilience, healthy management of emotions, and improved coping skills for dealing with issues including depression, anxiety, and anger. The qualitative results showed that the most robust changes for students were seen in their ability to better manage their anger, their ability to make better decisions in life through the newly acquired skill of weighing the pros and cons in situations, acquisition of new coping skills which helped youth to calm down and think of solutions to problems as opposed to just reacting in the moment, and finally, the new awareness of their personal vulnerabilities, which helped many youth to make better decisions for themselves when presented with tempting offers to join extremist groups, join friends in doing drugs, etc. One female youth said, when asked what she learned, “we learned how to cope (with) problems in life. Everyone faces problems in life so we learned how to cope up and every individual has their own different way how to cope up. I also learned about managing our anger”. Focusing on her new skills in anger management, another female participant explained,

{Prior to the training} “If I was mad or if I was angry then I just voiced out my anger at someone. I would just use violence and then words will hurt. But then after {going through the training} I realized that you as a person should not do it...{I should not show violence}. I found myself reading a lot to calm me down. Results from the two teacher-specific focus groups demonstrated that teachers felt confident and highly motivated to deliver the curriculum after a one-time teacher training in the material. While teachers were eager for additional training on the topic of mental health, they expressed confidence and depth of understanding of the main concepts and communicated confidence that the youth benefited (and changed behavior) as a result of the training. During one of the teacher FGDs, a teacher demonstrated how she incorporated the key elements of the Acceptance and Commitment Therapy approach into her reaction to students by saying “we {were sometimes} shocked when facilitating the module because we {were} also learning from our participants the {range} of all the struggles and experiences that happen ... we would explain to them that they are not the only ones to have challenges in life – just like myself, being gay, I have a lot of challenges in life and I share things with them so they realize they are not the only ones {experiencing challenges}.”
Limitations, Challenges, and/or Lessons Learned

Despite concern that the methodology (mental health expert trains master trainers who, in turn, train teachers in the materials) would not allow for significant transfer of knowledge to the youth, the evidence suggests otherwise. In fact, both the quantitative and qualitative data results support this model as one which can produce actual behavior change and in particular, enhanced resilience and coping with negative emotions. The initial training of master trainers was a three-day long process in which trainers were given a foundation in the key elements of cognitive-behavioral theory to help contextualize the actual curriculum activities and lessons. These trainers went on to train the educators of the youth. Focus group discussions conducted with the youth demonstrated that youth had obtained significant knowledge and many reported changes in behavior over time.

Interestingly, the main criticism or lesson learned was that the teachers thought they would have been even more effective in their approaches had they had more individualized training in the material and learned to apply the coping skills and cognitive-behavioral approaches to themselves. In fact, teachers communicated hunger and eagerness for more training tailored specifically to their own needs, as a way to enhance their effectiveness with their students.

Educators are the key to delivering large-scale mental health interventions globally. While it is outside of their role and training to deliver focused, manualized psychological treatment for specific disorders, they are certainly able to deliver lessons based on basic, proven psychological principles which can help youth learn how to cope in healthier ways and think differently – both of which can improve mental health.

References


### Description of Crisis-Specific Challenge

In El Salvador, teachers (and students) face significant social and emotional challenges, including threats of gang violence and community insecurity that impact their psycho-social well-being, cause uncertainty about the future, and increase levels of stress. A recent study from the El Salvador Ministry of Health reported on the prevalence of chronic illnesses among teachers associated with stress and the need to identify and respond to physical and psychological signs of stress before the damage is irreversible (MINSAL, 2017). Increased stress levels ultimately impact teachers’ relationships with students, parents, and colleagues, which in turn impact teaching and learning.

To ensure that students receive quality education in this complex setting, teachers in El Salvador must develop social and emotional competencies that support their personal well-being, as well as the social-emotional needs of their students. When teachers learn to regulate and manage their own emotions, they are able to maximize their effectiveness in the classroom (Jennings, 2015). As part of the Millennium Challenge Corporation (MCC)-funded Strengthening the National Education System Program, FHI 360 is building social-emotional capacity of teachers through targeted social-emotional learning strategies and mindfulness practices to reduce stress levels and increase effectiveness of classroom management.

### Brief Overview

The “Social Emotional Development for Teachers” Program in El Salvador is being implemented from 2018-2019 as part of the Strengthening the National Education System (SNES) Program funded by MCC and implemented by FHI 360. Social Emotional Development for Teachers Program participants include over 3,000 primary and secondary teachers, as well as principals who also have teaching duties. Approximately 65% of the teachers are women, about 70% live and work in rural settings, and the majority are over age 40. Baseline data collected from teacher participants showed that 32% of teachers experience high to moderate levels of perceived stress and that 38% tend to suppress their emotions, which has been shown to ultimately result in higher levels of stress.

The teachers work in 350 schools that form 45 school clusters. These 45 school clusters form the treatment group of SNES and were randomly assigned to the treatment group by an external evaluator commissioned by MCC. The teachers receive 120 hours of training, including 48 hours of in-person workshops (six 8-hour workshops), 48 hours of post-workshop application activities (including individual exercises, group activities, and classroom application with students), and 24 hours of virtual activities.
The Program integrates two evidence-based social-emotional frameworks to create a customized professional development opportunity tailored to the social-emotional needs of Salvadoran teachers. The Collaborative for Academic Social and Emotional Learning (CASEL) Five Core Competencies form the foundation of the Program’s theoretical framework, as each of the six modules focuses on one or more of the five CASEL competencies: self-awareness, self-management, social awareness, relationship skills, and responsible decision making. The Search Institute’s 40 Developmental Assets, drawn from its Developmental Assets Framework (1997), have been mapped onto the CASEL core competencies and adapted for adults, resulting in 40 concrete skills that teachers in El Salvador can build to help them develop the five core competencies.

The content of in-person workshops and post-workshop activities is drawn from multiple evidence-based sources, including (1) mindfulness activities from the book Mindfulness for Teachers and activities from the Colombian organization RESPIRA, (2) psychosocial support materials from INEE and War Child Holland, and social-emotional learning resources from IRC and Save the Children. The program first develops teachers’ intrapersonal social emotional competencies, before moving to interpersonal competencies and positive classroom strategies, as shown by the workshop sequence below:

1. Social and Emotional Well-being: An introduction to social-emotional well-being for teachers
2. Intrapersonal Mindfulness: Developing mindful awareness; identifying and managing our inner thoughts and emotions
3. Self-Care: Prioritizing self-care practices as essential for integrated development
4. Interpersonal Mindfulness: Fostering compassion, connectedness, and meaningful relationships
5. Positive Social Emotional Experiences: Promoting positive social and emotional experiences within ourselves and our students
6. Balanced Caring and Positive Classroom Environment: Understanding the importance of contribution and creating a balanced approach to caring for others, and cultivating and sustaining a positive classroom climate

To adapt and validate this content to the El Salvador context, the Program has taken the following steps:

1. The first part of the workshop design process involved reviewing the CASEL and 40 Developmental Asset frameworks with the FHI 360 team in El Salvador (composed entirely of Salvadoran nationals). The team reviewed the Spanish translation of the CASEL framework and did an exercise to adapt the 40 Developmental Assets Framework for adults, which was later reviewed and finalized by FHI 360’s social-emotional learning experts. The El Salvador team then jointly designed the structure of the six workshops with the team of social-emotional learning experts. The workshop topics and frameworks were validated and approved by the Ministry of Education.

2. For every module, the design process has involved the following steps: (1) draft module developed by FHI 360 social emotional learning experts, (2) modules reviewed by FHI 360 team in El Salvador, (3) module materials reviewed and edited by Ministry of Education, (4) facilitators trained in new module content, providing recommendations for final tweaks to content and/or implementation strategies.
Evidence and Outcomes

The El Salvador “Social Emotional Development for Teachers” program is still being implemented. To date, five workshops have been completed, with one workshop, school coaching visit, and the culminating activity remaining to be completed by early 2020. The program will be evaluated through a mixed-methods study employing both quantitative and qualitative methods.

The quantitative evaluation involves applying a survey to approximately 1,600 teachers who participated in the social-emotional development program and comparing the results to a control group that was established as part of an external randomized evaluation commissioned by MCC. This external evaluator randomized 147 school clusters, resulting in a treatment group of 45 clusters and a control group of 55 clusters. The remaining 47 clusters are not participating in the study.

The survey combines five existing reliable and valid scales used to measure social-emotional competencies that have been translated and contextualized to El Salvador through cognitive interviews with teachers and an initial pilot. Cognitive interviews are used to study how individuals mentally process and respond to survey questions and can therefore help to ensure that translated surveys have the intended meaning (Lavrakas, 2008). In this case, we conducted cognitive interviews with a sample of 30 teachers in El Salvador to inform adjustments to the language used in the survey, ensuring that scales adapted from other contexts would make sense to teachers in El Salvador.

The survey will be applied during the sixth workshop and will measure the impact of the workshops on teachers’ mindfulness, self-awareness, emotion regulation, positive affect, negative affect, stress, and teacher emotional burnout.

The qualitative portion of the evaluation will consist of individual interviews and focus groups with teachers together additional data to complement the quantitative data. While endline data has yet to be collected, preliminary results will be available by the start of November 2019. The project team in El Salvador has gathered testimonials and anecdotal evidence from teachers who have participated in the workshops. Teachers report applying mindfulness techniques regularly at home and at school to reduce stress and improve their own mental and physical well-being. They also report improved relationships and interactions with colleagues and students by applying strategies in active listening and positive communication, among others.

Limitations, Challenges, and/or Lessons Learned

A key challenge in implementing this program has been teacher attendance. This workshop series is one of approximately six training activities that have required teachers to miss classes with students. As a result, not all 2,700 teachers have participated in all social emotional workshops. This is problematic, as the workshops are designed to build upon one another. To address these issues, future adaptations and iterations of this program could include the following adaptations (advantages and disadvantages are discussed for each option):

1. Include less in-person training and more virtual activities. The advantage of this approach is that it would allow teachers to miss less class time with students and enable teachers to learn at their own pace. The disadvantage of less in-person training is missing the opportunity to learn from a trained facilitator and not being able to learn through as many interactions with peers.

2. Consider in-person training times that do not require teachers to miss classes (such as Saturdays or pre-established national professional development days). The advantage here is that teachers would miss fewer classes with students, but the disadvantage is that attendance may be lower on Saturday sessions. In fact, Saturday sessions could interfere with teachers’ work-life balance, which may be counter-productive for a teacher well-being program.
3. Strive to develop stand-alone modules that are less dependent on content from other modules. The advantage of this approach is that teachers who miss one session would be able to join additional sessions without being lost or confused. Additionally, stand-alone modules would allow for more flexibility in adapting and/or reordering modules to fit the needs of future PD programs. However, the disadvantage of having standalone modules is that (1) they may be very hard to design as much of the SEL content is interconnected, and teachers may have a more disjointed (rather than integrated) PD experience and may fail to make connections on their own between content.

Another key challenge has been monitoring the completion of post-workshop activities by teachers. The initial plan was for all teachers to document their post workshop activities in their teacher guides, which have logs to register mindfulness activities, reflection questions for readings, attendance lists, and questions to respond to for group work. At the start of each new in-person workshop, teachers begin the session by discussing their post workshop activities while the facilitator circulates around the room to document who had completed the work and who didn’t (teachers are asked to bring the previous teacher guide to the new workshop to show their complete work).

However, there have been two challenges: (1) not enough teachers are filling out the post-workshop activity pages in the teacher guide and (2) facilitators have not done a consistent job of documenting completion of post-workshop activities, as they struggle to find time to check-in with each participant during the workshop. It would have been ideal to digitize these post workshop activities to be able to track completion using technology. The Program made a decision to avoid online activities since not all schools have Internet connectivity, but in hindsight, it may have been best to develop online/digital activities for the majority of participants and to develop alternative “hard copy” activities for those without technology.

References

Description of Crisis-Specific Challenge

More than 2.3 million South Sudanese refugees are seeking asylum in neighboring countries, including Uganda, which is currently hosting over 800,000 refugees from South Sudan (UNHCR, 2019a). Within South Sudan, an additional 1.97 million are internally displaced (UNHCR, 2019b). Young people make up a disproportionate number of those displaced, and many have missed years of school (UNHCR, 2019b).

In an effort to address the educational needs of this population, Oxfam IBIS has organized an EU-funded consortium of partners called “Education for Life” in Uganda and South Sudan. The project includes multiple activities designed to help support the well-being and resilience of learners, teachers, and education systems. Our research focuses on the well-being of teachers and learners and how they interact with each other and with program components. Specifically, we focus on two main project activities: accelerated education (AE), which aims to support youth whose education has been disrupted, and teacher education professional development (TEPD), which helps to strengthen teachers’ competencies. There is a paucity of knowledge on AE, TEPD, and well-being in crisis and displacement contexts; yet, research suggests the central role education, and teachers in particular, play in supporting their learners’ achievement and well-being in these settings (Schwille, Dembélé & Schubert, 2011; Winthrop & Kirk, 2005). Our research aims to fill these gaps by generating evidence and learning for the project as well as for the broader field.

Brief Overview

Drawing on the INEE Teachers in Crisis Contexts (TiCC) Training for Primary School Teachers, the TEPD is led by the Luigi Giussani Institute for Higher Education and other implementing partners for AE in the four project sites: AVSI Uganda in Palabek settlement, Uganda; AVSI South Sudan in Torit; Oxfam South Sudan in Juba; and Community Development Initiative in Kapoeta, South Sudan. These consortium partners follow the national AE policies and frameworks in their respective countries. Looking beyond academic achievement, the research team is examining the ways in which AE learners and AE teachers contribute to one another’s well-being and how teacher and learner well-being influence and/or are influenced by the broader community and the consortium’s interventions. The research aims to fill the prominent gap in knowledge on teacher and learner well-being and AE in crisis and displacement contexts.

This case study focuses on the research concerning teacher well-being. Many of the teachers have experienced displacement, either during previous conflicts in the region or during the current conflict. In Palabek settlement, the teachers are primarily Ugandan, with some South Sudanese. Given the protracted nature of the conflict in their country, the South Sudanese teachers in Palabek previously attended Teacher Training Colleges in Uganda while formerly displaced there. Meanwhile, a number of Ugandan teachers in Palabek are from the district or neighboring areas in northern
Uganda and grew up displaced or affected by local armed conflicts. In Juba and Torit, the teachers are South Sudanese. Many received training in neighboring countries (e.g., Kenya, Uganda) while formerly displaced, others are internally displaced and were previously trained in South Sudan, while still others have not received any formal teacher training prior to becoming teachers in South Sudan.

Our mixed methods study is taking place over four years (2018-2021), the same duration as the project. We have begun conducting qualitative research (semi-structured, in-depth interviews and classroom and school observations) in three project sites: Palabek settlement, Uganda, and Juba and Torit, South Sudan. The goal of this initial research has been to better understand local definitions and experiences of well-being among teachers and learners. The team will continue to conduct qualitative research throughout the project, and in the third and fourth years of the study, the team will design, pilot, and implement a survey on well-being.

**Evidence and Outcomes**

Between August 2018 and August 2019, the research team completed a desk review of teacher well-being, conducted exploratory research to better understand local definitions of teacher well-being, and conducted the first round of in-depth qualitative research with AE teachers. From the desk review, we found the literature identified two important areas of well-being - feeling and functioning - and four central components of well-being - social connectedness, self-efficacy, resilience, and stress and anxiety.

The exploratory research supported much of what we discovered in the desk review and added rich context-specific details. In this phase, we conducted 34 interviews and two focus group discussions (11 teachers) in Palabek settlement, Torit, and Juba. In addition to bolstering our findings from the desk review, these discussions uncovered important factors that contribute to teacher well-being, including access to basic needs, teacher professional development, and a sense of duty and obligation to the next generation. Further, the importance of one’s environment on well-being highlighted the relevance of Bronfenbrenner’s (1979) socio-ecological model, which recognizes the interrelated environments, interactions, and relationships that may contribute to well-being.

The second round of in-depth qualitative research in Palabek settlement and Juba, which drew on the first round, included two interviews with 29 AE teachers (total interviews = 58). The first interview focused on the teachers’ experiences in the school, while the second focused on their life in the community. Emerging, selected findings from these interviews suggest the important role education and teacher-student relationships play in helping or hindering well-being.

Regarding the role of education, teachers frequently discussed their motivation to teach in terms of the long-term impact it will have on their country through their learners. In South Sudan, teachers talked about how education may be the only route to peace, and therefore, those who have gone to school have a responsibility to educate the next generation. As one teacher in Juba, South Sudan said when explaining why he became a teacher: “To make stability for this country, to be at permanent peace - or to bring the permanent peace here - let us go to school. If you have a knowledge, you go there and teach.”

Regarding teacher-student relationships, teachers spoke of the pride they felt in seeing their learners excel in school as well as the additional roles they took on to ensure their learners’ success. In Uganda, a female teacher shared that one of her learners had recently come back to school after having a baby. The teacher explained, “this one made me [feel] very proud because through talking to her, she has decided to remain in the school. And when she was doing the exams, we were the one taking care of the baby ... I personally ... was caring for the baby, giving her time to ... sit for the exams.” The teacher continued with an ear-to-ear smile that this learner had scored the highest in her class.
On the other hand, relationships with learners can also be a source of stress for teachers if they feel ill-equipped to handle the challenges their learners face—especially when first beginning to teach in a displacement context. The same teacher shared, “if at times when my learners come to school and they are really sad, I feel also stressed. I feel I should find out the problem that learner is undergoing … Now when I ask and I find out that thing, it really stressed me. Because I always take their problem as mine [and] because at times, I cannot support them fully.”

Limitations, Challenges, and/or Lessons Learned

Working with many partners in a consortium across two countries presents exciting opportunities and unique challenges. One challenge has been the coordination of project activities, some of which have been delayed. These delays may be attributed to different factors, such as a lack of clarity around who is responsible for specific project activities, or the time needed to secure approval by Ministry officials of the TEPD approach. Additional costs of conducting fieldwork (e.g. transportation costs, insurance premiums) required that we reduce the number of research sites and the amount of time in the field. Importantly, this combined with connectivity issues required that we scale-back the participatory methodology initially envisioned. An approach we feel is particularly relevant to adopt when conducting research on holistic experiences such as well-being (explained more below).

From these challenges and opportunities, we have learned many lessons, three of which we would like to highlight: coordinating evaluation and research in a consortium, increasing the ‘participatory’ nature of the research, and contextualizing well-being.

First, as the research partner within a large consortium, it has been important to structure the research as independent from project implementation and evaluation. The European Union has heralded the need for research and supported such work through their Building Resilience in Crises through Education initiative. Yet, research does not replace monitoring and evaluation (M&E), and in a large consortium, it is important to coordinate M&E activities across various partners. It is necessary to adequately fund both research and M&E, and to consider them complementary but distinct.

Secondly, as researchers attempting to foreground the experiences of participants, our work has confirmed the importance of increasing the time with participants through: more time in the field, multiple interviews, and multiple field visits over time. Constant communication may be difficult given the constraints of working in crisis-affected contexts; however, prioritizing more points of contact over broader coverage is more likely to build the relationships and depth of knowledge necessary to foreground local perspectives and engage in more participatory approaches.

Finally, our emerging findings show the value of investing time in understanding the well-being of teachers early in an intervention, particularly as well-being will look different across various contexts, populations, and individuals. Although our research is independent, we have shared initial findings with the consortium in order to inform their ongoing work. We recommend building qualitative data collection and analyses of teacher well-being into routine needs assessment processes in order to help projects provide relevant, responsive support to teachers at every stage of their intervention.
References


1.8 Coaching-observing-reflecting-engaging (CORE) for teachers: A well-being and support intervention for teachers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>War Child Holland</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Author</td>
<td>April Coetzee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Locations</td>
<td>Colombia and Occupied Palestinian Territories</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher Profiles</td>
<td>Refugee teachers, IDP teachers, and host community teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Topic</td>
<td>Teacher well-being</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Description of Crisis-Specific Challenge**

Few evidence-based interventions are available to help teachers build the complex skill sets needed to effectively address the barriers and the multi-faceted demands they encounter in their professional lives (Hardman et al., 2011). Those that are available traditionally treat teachers like production functions: inputs being in-service trainings focused on specific curricula, and outputs being gains in student learning, with little attention to helping teachers navigate the roles, expectations, and stressors they must balance at the nexus of students’ lives and systems’ accountability (Schwartz, Cappella, & Aber 2019). Research has shown that stress and burnout, particularly prevalent among the least experienced teachers, radiates to affect teacher attendance and attrition, pedagogical and classroom quality, and student outcomes, with cascading impacts on education systems (Hoglund et al., 2015; McLean & Connor, 2015; Wolf et al., 2015).

War Child Holland is researching the effectiveness of a holistic teacher support program that provides individualized and scaffolded psychological care and real time support to teachers through a continuous quality improvement-based coaching model. Drawing inspiration from Jennings and Greenberg’s (2009) prosocial classroom theoretical model, the aim of the Coaching - Observing - Reflecting - Engaging (CORE) intervention is to have a positive impact on classroom climate by providing teachers with the skills and knowledge to create an enabling, impactful, and safe learning environment.

**Brief Overview**

Colombia has seen more than five decades of armed conflict which has had a devastating impact on the education system in some departments of the country. The conflict has led to a breakdown of social norms leading to increased psychosocial needs of children, violence in the classroom, and lack of engagement between teachers and children. In the Gaza Strip, the recurrent conflict has disrupted education services and impacted the psychosocial well-being of children and teachers leading to a deterioration in learning outcomes. Schools in Gaza are chronically overcrowded, resulting in student difficulties in focusing on their studies and heightened levels of violence in schools. In both of these settings, the project worked or will be working in formal schools with teachers who have had some pre-service training. As the project has a whole school approach, the demographics of the teachers in regards to years of experience, subject focus, age, gender, and pre- and post-service training will vary. The model is developed to work with individual teachers as much as possible, allowing for some adaptations developing on individual needs.

Through a whole school, real time, and continuous quality improvement-based coaching model, CORE will support the teachers to build skills in three main areas:
1. Teacher social-emotional competencies: Building teachers own SEL competencies: Based on CASEL's 5 core competencies, the coaches individually mentor teachers to build personal social-emotional competencies that directly relate to competencies that they wish to build in children.

2. Teacher well-being: Based on acceptance and commitment therapy (ACT), using a mindfulness and acceptance approach. Coaches support the building of knowledge and skills to equip teachers with the necessary tools to improve their self-care, manage their stress, gain emotional regulation, and create positive classroom environment.

3. Positive classroom management: Focused on behaviour management and core classroom management and planning skills.

The development of this intervention has included:

- A scoping study of research and current teacher professional development (TPD) programming which contributed to the development of a theory of change;
- A formative qualitative study in Colombia with key education actors including teachers, school governing bodies, and ministry to inform the development of the intervention;
- A four-month proof of concept (PoC) which examined feasibility, user-experience, and acceptability of CORE; and
- Adaptation of methodology based on findings from PoC.

The next steps planned in the development of CORE include establishing the research agenda, culminating in an effectiveness study. In particular, this will focus on the current context-relevant process pilot study in Gaza in partnership with Global TIES for viability and feasibility. This will provide an opportunity to fine-tune the research and program implementation protocols in preparation for impact evaluation.

### Evidence and Outcomes

The assumption being tested is that CORE will lead to improvement in quality of education in three levels:

1. Our primary outcome is focused at the teacher level, including improving teachers’ emotion regulation, mindfulness, and teachers’ psychological well-being; reducing teachers’ feelings of burnout/distress; increasing teachers’ self-efficacy and engagement; and increasing teachers’ knowledge and competency in classroom management and planning.

2. A secondary outcome, at the student level, is that we expect teachers’ improved ability to directly model social-emotional skills and improve classroom interaction quality to lead to changes in student teacher engagement.

3. At the school level, as CORE coaches will work with all teachers in a school, we expect improvements in whole school climate and peer support.

While the PoC showed that some key elements of CORE were on the whole feasible, acceptable, and relevant to the teachers, it also identified key ways of improving and adapting the methodology. These included:

1. To improve trust and acceptance of CORE in the school:
   a. Coaches spend one week in the school assisting the teachers outside of their roles as a coach.
b. Ensure that the teachers understand the whole process of the intervention at the beginning.

c. A whole school approach ensures that there is not mistrust or fear as to why a teacher has been selected for the intervention.

2. To improve the content of the methodology:

a. Initial training of coaches is to be no more than three weeks with a focus on coaching skills and well-being training.

b. The remainder of coaching training is to be broken up at the start of each module.

c. Begin each module with a whole school information session to allow for clarity of the module’s aim and provide a forum for teachers to share.

d. Reduce the amount of in-class support to one identified exercise per cycle and increase observations to two sessions per cycle.

e. Strengthen reflection and mindfulness support for teachers during individual support.

f. Provide examples of other activities for teachers to use in their practice.

The study will also outline key findings that informed the adaptation of the methodology and discuss the following data that informed the development of the intervention.

- Scoping review findings,
- Development of CORE theory of change,
- Qualitative and quantitative data from the proof of concept,
- Adaptation workshop and changes to methodology.

With few validated outcome measures in education, especially for teacher well-being and teacher social emotional competencies, further research on CORE will also discuss the identification of outcome measures and the process undertaken to ensure these tools are valid and effective to measure the assumed outcomes.

**Limitations, Challenges, and/or Lessons Learned**

The current research process for CORE has embedded periods of reflection and adaptation before the final effectiveness study. The process has yielded the following learnings and points of critical reflection which will inform forthcoming research:

- Challenges and considerations of ethical research in crisis affected contexts - We will outline the learnings from CORE, not only in the effectiveness studies but in all the WCH research agenda, to ensure that the research process is ethical and contextualized.

- Contextualisation process for a generalised intervention – CORE has not been developed for one specific country context; further study will outline the learnings from the contextualisation processes to ensure the acceptability and relevance, especially around themes of well-being and social emotional competencies.

- Critical reflections focused on scale-up and cost efficiency – the forthcoming research will outline some of the critical thinking WCH has been engaging in around the issue of CORE’s ability to scale and cost efficiency.
References


McLean, Leigh, and Carol McDonald Connor. 2015. “Depressive Symptoms in Third-Grade Teachers: Relations to Classroom Quality and Student Achievement.” Child Development 86 no. 3: 945–954.


Refugee teachers in Lebanon: The challenges of managing professional expectations with personal experiences

Organization: Harvard University
Author: Elizabeth Adelman
Location: Lebanon
Teacher Profile: Refugee teachers
Topic: Teacher well-being

Description of Crisis-Specific Challenge

In settings of conflict and displacement, teachers are central to the possibility of education being protective and productive, rather than contributing to ongoing harm. In addition to delivering academic content, teachers must ensure a safe learning environment, support children’s emotional needs, foster social cohesion, and lay the foundations for peace and stability. The expectations held for teachers of refugees are significant. However, in many settings, the teachers teaching refugee populations are refugees themselves. Often these educators are navigating many of the same difficult circumstances their students face, including economic stress, emotional strain, and continued uncertainty about their futures.

Few studies consider the relationship between the personal and professional experiences of refugee educators and how tensions between these identities may influence teachers’ work and their well-being. This research looks to build a deeper understanding of how being a teacher influences the experience of being a refugee and conversely, how the experience of being a refugee influences the teacher’s role. Findings from this research suggest a need to rethink the types of support and training provided to refugee teachers in order to ensure success within the classroom.

Brief Overview

This research is situated in Lebanon and focuses on Syrian refugee teachers working to educate Syrian refugee students in non-formal schools. Lebanon is host to the greatest number of refugees per capita worldwide. Around 1 million Syrians and 450,000 Palestinians live within Lebanon, a combined population equivalent to one-quarter of the Lebanese population. The status of refugees in Lebanon is particularly complex as the Government of Lebanon is not signatory to the 1951 Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees and does not consider itself an asylum country. In Lebanon, teaching is considered a ‘protected profession, meaning legally, only Lebanese citizens are eligible to teach in schools accredited by the Ministry of Education and Higher Education (MEHE). Syrian refugee teachers hoping to continue working within their profession can only work in schools not recognized by MEHE, referred to in this research as non-formal schools.

This analysis is informed by interviews with 42 refugee educators across four non-formal schools and 116 school and classroom observations. Schools were selected based on physical location and educational structure. Three schools were located in the rural governante of the Beqaa, where the majority of Syrian refugees in Lebanon reside. One school was located in the urban capital of Beirut, which is host to the second largest number of Syrian refugees. These non-formal schools followed the Lebanese curriculum using Lebanese textbooks, taught the same core subjects as Lebanese public schools, and had a set of structured academic goals for each grade level that students were required to pass. These schools were managed by non-government organizations with no religious or sectarian affiliation.
When possible, every teacher interested in participating in the research study was given an opportunity. Before interviewing any teacher, I first observed them teaching at least twice. During classroom observations, I took note of the number of students in the classroom, the physical environment and available materials, learning activities, classroom routines, and interactions among students and teachers taking place during the lesson. The goal of these observations was to develop an understanding of the teacher’s pedagogical methods, the social and educational routines of the classroom, and to note how students engage with each other and with the teacher. I often referred to moments from these observations during interviews to help situate questions and elicit grounded reflections from teachers. Teachers often appeared to feel more comfortable speaking with me after I had spent time in their classrooms as they knew I had observed the complexities of their work. In addition, these observations provided an opportunity to interact multiple times more informally. I conducted semi-structured interviews with participants that were approximately one-hour in length and focused on teachers’ understanding of their role as educators supporting refugee students and their experience as refugees in Lebanon. Interviews were audio recorded, transcribed and, when necessary, translated. I wrote detailed memos after each interview, noting the major themes and patterns that arose in each interview as well as any divergent findings. From these memos, I developed a set of codes for analyzing the data. To develop these codes, I also drew on findings from an earlier pilot study and was guided by literature around teacher identity. The final set of codes used for this analysis included codes such as ‘personal journey’, ‘professional identity’, and ‘envisioning the future’. I coded the interview transcripts and field notes using the qualitative data analysis software Atlas.ti. In an effort to ensure internal consistency in regards to coding, I engaged in simultaneous coding with a research partner. In instances when our coding differed, we discussed these discrepancies and resolved them together. Using the classroom observation data, I created school profiles in which I noted patterns regarding student-teacher interactions, the classroom environment, and common pedagogical approaches.

**Evidence and Outcomes**

This analysis shows refugee educators struggling to balance obligations related to teaching refugees with the realities of living as refugees. Educators welcomed the opportunity to reclaim a professional identity through teaching. They saw themselves as playing an instrumental role in reconstructing the lives of their refugee students by supporting students to learn, grow, and dream about a better future. This responsibility provided a sense of purpose and accomplishment that motivated them to continue in their roles as educators, regardless of the continual challenges they faced in their classrooms. Teachers also saw their efforts as a concrete way to assist their own community and felt uplifted by the opportunity to extend care and support to their students.

However, in their personal lives, educators struggled with loss of hope, psychological exhaustion, and high levels of stress. Educators felt powerless to transcend the social, economic, and political barriers constructed around them in Lebanon. As refugees, these educators faced considerable challenges as they worked to re-establish their own lives, tend to their own psychosocial needs, and develop their own vision for the future. These challenges made the hard work of teaching even harder, especially as the conflict became protracted and future stability seemed far from reach.

This research suggests the need to provide teachers working in conflict-affected settings with opportunities within their schools to build community with fellow teachers to help mitigate the psychological stress educators experience. In addition, there is a need to integrate mechanisms into the school structure that allow teachers to collaboratively address complex challenges present in their classrooms. Teachers should also be provided with psychological support services and training regarding how best to help their students’ social and emotional recovery. Finally, financial stability was one source of stress shared by all refugee educators. Ensuring teachers earn a salary reflective of their efforts and the financial reality of their current location is a necessary step to supporting and legitimizing the work of these professionals.
Limitations, Challenges, and/or Lessons Learned

While qualitative research allows a deeper understanding of a particular phenomenon, as a research method, it is not possible to draw broad generalizations from the findings. The research documented here reflects the experience of a select group of Syrian refugee teachers working in Lebanon. Their reflections are directly related to the conditions that they are facing, conditions that may be quite different from refugee teachers working in other countries or even in other settings within Lebanon. This research should be seen as simply a starting point to documenting the relationship between personal and professional experiences of refugee teachers. Expanding this research into a longitudinal study of the experiences of Syrian refugee teachers working in other locations across Lebanon could help provide both further evidence of the complexity of the personal-professional relationship as well as allow insight into how these identities shift and develop over time. Expanding this work into other countries and settings would also help provide a greater understanding of the different types of supports refugee teachers need to ensure their professional and personal well-being. While understanding the experiences of any refugee teacher would afford useful insight, one approach to extending this research specifically would be to consider Syrian refugee teachers in other host-country settings. For example, how do Syrian refugee teachers in Turkey, Jordan, or Germany make meaning out of the experience of being a refugee and being a teacher? Given the different social and political contexts, how do these understandings diverge and converge and what can they tell us about the types of support teachers need more broadly and what seems to be particularly contextual?

References


Relevant Links

- [Inside Syrian Refugee Schools: Teachers struggle to create conditions for learning](#)
- [Inside Syrian Refugee Schools: In their search for a destination, teachers face difficult choices](#)
2: Case Studies on Teacher Management
2.1 The challenges of equitable community teacher stipends in conflict affected areas of Myanmar

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Rural Indigenous Sustainable Education (RISE)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Authors</td>
<td>Ei Ei Phyu (Crystal White); Catherine Johnston; Andrea Costa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Location</td>
<td>Myanmar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher Profile</td>
<td>Community teachers in Myanmar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Topic</td>
<td>Teacher management</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Description of Crisis-Specific Challenge

Community teachers in Myanmar are paid a profoundly unjust stipend. They are not recognised by the Myanmar Ministry of Education (MoE) and are supported by Indigenous providers of education who rely heavily on donor funding. Each year, funding levels fluctuate causing strain on Indigenous education systems. This means that Indigenous providers of education struggle to provide even a basic stipend for their teachers. Stipend amounts are well below the basic wage.

In early 2021, RISE commissioned research to explore the challenges and opportunities for creating a more sustainable and equitable salary payment system for community teachers. The research acknowledged and honoured all community teachers in Myanmar and found that the amounts paid to community teachers did not follow global guidance and good practices for equitable teacher compensation in conflict and recovery contexts.

Community teachers provide education to Myanmar’s most vulnerable children during periods of conflict and crisis, often at great personal risk and sacrifice. The coup and the return to military rule in Myanmar has brought into stark relief the critical role that community teachers play in providing education during periods of conflict and crisis. Community teachers are once again essential to the immediate humanitarian response and post-crisis recovery.

Community teachers are different from Myanmar government teachers. Their profile and experiences are unique. Community teachers are typically female, in their late 20s, have completed a high school education and have six years of teaching experience. In comparison, Myanmar government teachers, who are also typically female, are older (in their early 30s), more educated (university degree) and have an additional year of teaching experience.

Community teachers are recruited from the local community. Importantly, this means that community teachers share the local ethnic language and culture of the children they teach and are therefore more likely to use students’ mother tongue in their classroom instruction. It also means that community teachers are more likely to be present in class compared to their government teacher counterparts, have higher job satisfaction and plan to continue in their teaching role for at least a year.

Community teacher confidence levels are often low. This is likely because they have had limited professional development opportunities and face extremely difficult teaching conditions. Community teachers typically lack confidence in subject content, managing the classroom using positive discipline, writing a lesson plan, creating questions to check student understanding, and using group work effectively. At the same time, community teachers are more likely to teach a multigrade class and are challenged by a lack of subject knowledge, insufficient teaching and learning materials and teaching students with different learning abilities.

Because community teacher stipends are so low, a significant proportion (40%) of community teachers have a second job to support themselves and their families. The research recommended a phased approach to resolve the issue. This included establishing interim measures to create a more equitable
salary payment system, and calling upon development and humanitarian actors to collaborate with Indigeneous providers of education to develop consistent standards that meet the daily needs of community teachers. It highlighted that such a payment system should pave the way for the recognition and integration of community teachers within an inclusive national education system when a legitimate government is restored in Myanmar.

**Brief Overview**

The research was informed by the interests of Indigenous providers of education and development partners. These were:

**Why is a sustainable and equitable salary payment system for community teachers relevant and needed in Myanmar?**

This question explored:
- The flow of funding to Indigenous providers of education,
- The impacts of COVID-19 on sources of funding, and
- The dilemmas that exist in operationalising the humanitarian-development nexus in fragile protracted crisis contexts.

**What are the challenges and opportunities in developing a sustainable and equitable salary payment system for community teachers in the future?**

The research considered:
- The challenge that Indigenous providers of education face in engaging Ethnic Armed Organisations (EAOs) in their respective areas and the MoE to establish a long-term vision for community teacher salaries,
- Opportunities development partners could explore through the conditions upon which they provide budget support to the government of Myanmar, and
- The willingness of development partners to support community teacher salaries in the interim.

**What are the factors that need to be considered to develop equitable salary standards for community teachers?**

The research explored:
- The long-term vision of Indigenous providers toward financing their systems,
- EAO arrangements for financial support to schools,
- Recognition of prior learning and accreditation pathways for community teachers, and
- Realistic options exist for financing community teachers.

**What key actions would need to be taken to secure international donor support for community teacher stipends?**

This question examined:
- The feasibility of Indigenous providers creating a sustainability strategy for the payment of community teacher salaries given the current context of limited financing options and donor concerns related to potential aid diversion and aid dependency.

The research initially examined existing data from RISE to build the profile of community teachers in Myanmar. We held Focus Group Discussions (FGDs) and Key Informant Interviews (KII) with RISE
network members, Education in Emergency (EiE) cluster NGOs, NGO members of the Ethnic Education in States and Regions (EESR) group, and development partners to gather their insights and perspectives on the research topic. Additionally, we held validation workshops with RISE to ensure that the emerging findings and recommendations were relevant and aligned to the needs of the RISE network and their advocacy agenda.

**Evidence and Outcomes**

Remuneration scales should consider: 1) Cost of living / providing a living wage, 2) current government salary scales, and 3) teacher qualifications and / or years of experience. The research found that the amounts paid to community teachers do not adhere to these standards. Community teachers are paid below the minimum wage. Some community teachers are paid less than a third of what government primary teachers are paid.

There is a tremendous strain on the community teacher salary payment system. Indigenous providers of education do not have sufficient financial resources, and development partners are concerned about paying teacher stipends when uncertainty surrounds funding continuity. Remittances and other sources of local funding, which prop up community-based education services, have diminished as COVID-19 has ravaged local and regional labour migration. This, coupled with the economic crisis unfolding across the country, means there are few viable sources of funding to support more equitable salaries for community teachers.

Yet, there is hope. Examples of what is possible exist. In Myanmar, the humanitarian sector has made commendable efforts to harmonise salary standards for non-government teachers in Rakhine and Kachin States. This has established an important precedent that can guide future commitments of development partners.

In Rakhine State, harmonisation efforts have involved progressively aligning volunteer teacher stipends with MoE salary standards in Internally Displaced Persons (IDP) camps and host communities. In 2013/14, the Myanmar MoE responded to high levels of teacher absenteeism in IDP camps and host communities by recruiting and paying the salaries of volunteer teachers previously employed by EiE sector partners. While this was welcomed by EiE sector partners, the discrepancy between MoE and EiE sector salary payments for volunteer teachers created tensions and raised concerns among volunteer teachers. Consequently, the EiE sector agreed on standardised volunteer teacher salaries that progressively aligned with MoE salary standards. By September 2019, parity between MoE and EiE sector salaries was achieved.

In Kachin State, the inequity in teacher salaries paid by the MoE and EiE sector partners and the desire to sustain community teachers and education services in conflict-affected townships and remote areas has led EiE sector partners to collaborative establish a standard salary scale for the payment of community teachers. To this end, the EiE sector has consulted widely to produce a draft salary scale that considers incentive rates, hardship/remote location, cost of living/living wage and teacher salary levels paid by government and non-state actors.

The research found that greater harmonisation between humanitarian and development actors in Myanmar is needed. It provided guidance on how to establish and align standards, and pointed to the utility of multi-donor trust funds (MDTFs) and pooled funding arrangements to support equitable community teacher stipends. The Afghanistan Reconstruction Trust Fund (ARTF) is an interesting example of a MDTF. The ARTF pooled aid funding from 27 donors and allowed for the payment of recurrent expenditure, such as teacher salaries. This was critical in underpinning efforts to rebuild service delivery systems and was a key strength of the ARTF approach to supporting the transitional government.

In the Myanmar context, coordination mechanisms exist that could be utilised to harmonise community teacher salaries and, most importantly, to fund them. The Education in Ethnic States and Regions (EESR) forum is a coordination platform for INGOs, donors, and Indigenous providers of education.
working to support education in ethnic conflict affected areas of the country. The EESR group has established a Teacher Support Taskforce (TSTF). The TSTF strategy includes developing and implementing common salary standards, supporting Indigenous providers of education to plan for sustainable teacher support, and advocating for international donors to continue their support to community teacher stipends in a coordinated and sustainable way. At the same time, donors have pooled funding to support the Myanmar Education Consortium (MEC), which was established to support complementary education systems, including Indigenous education systems, throughout the country.

These initial progressive steps have been taken: establishing a closer link to the EiE cluster’s work on harmonisation of salaries in IDP settings and the creation of the TSTF and its strategy. These are small but important preliminary actions.

Resolving the issue of community teacher salary in the short-term is critically important. It will enable Indigenous providers of education to meet the immediate education needs of Myanmar’s most vulnerable children during the current period of conflict and instability. It will also enable them to keep negotiating for recognition of Indigenous education systems and schools when a legitimate government is restored in Myanmar. This is imperative if 10 years of progress towards inclusive education, peace, and democracy in Myanmar are not to be lost due to the Myanmar military’s actions.

**Limitations, Challenges, and/or Lessons Learned**

The research was undertaken while events related to the military coup that deposed the legitimate Myanmar government were unfolding. This changed the nature of the research, which had initially sought to include the Myanmar government in identifying a collective way forward. It meant that KIIIs with MoE authorities, who were a key stakeholder for the research, were not possible. As such, recommendations for MoE actions were not directly presented.

Furthermore, COVID-19 travel restrictions and the unfolding security situation also meant it was not possible to visit Myanmar during the research period. This resulted in a reliance on Zoom for FGDs, KIIIs and workshops with RISE members. While informants engaged fully in the process, connectivity at times disrupted discussions. This was compounded by the military regime’s periodic internet shutdowns. A high degree of flexibility was therefore maintained throughout the research period so as to secure remote FGDs, KIIIs, and workshops with key stakeholders who were committed to contributing to the research on this important issue, despite the challenging context.
2.2 What promising strategies exist for the management of primary level teachers in refugee hosting areas in Kenya and where are there potential areas for further development?

Organizations
Education Development Trust and IIEP-UNESCO

Authors
Helen West and Katja Hinz

Location
Kenya

Teacher Profiles
Refugee teachers and national teachers working with refugee learners.

Topic
Teacher management

Description of Crisis-Specific Challenge

The call set out in the Incheon Declaration and Framework for Action for the Implementation of Sustainable Development Goal 4 is to: ‘ensure that teachers and educators are empowered, adequately recruited, well-trained, professionally qualified, motivated and supported within well-resourced, efficient and effectively governed systems’ (UNESCO, 2016).

In the refugee-hosting countries of Turkana and Garissa in Kenya however, there are a range of challenges associated with the recruitment, professional development, and retention of teachers. In refugee camp schools in particular, the majority of teachers are refugees without the requisite formal teaching qualifications. Further compounding this challenge is the high turnover rate, resulting in practical and logistical difficulties in providing teachers with relevant professional development opportunities. Retention of experienced teachers is also an ongoing challenge. Refugee teachers may return to their home countries or gain employment in other sectors, while Kenyan teachers often seek positions in counties that are considered to be safer and closer to urban centers.

This research will analyze the barriers and identify good practice around teacher management in refugee hosting areas in Kenya in order to produce meaningful and practical recommendations supporting improved teacher working conditions and teaching capacities.

Brief Overview

Effective teacher management is key to ensuring inclusive and equitable quality education for all children, including refugees, yet much of the data available about teachers of refugees are limited to numbers, qualifications and certification, and compensation. With this in mind, this case study aims to contribute to the teacher management evidence base. Taking into account the inclusive approach of the Comprehensive Refugee Response Framework, Djibouti Declaration, and Nairobi Declaration, which Kenya is signatory to, the research will also analyze the alignment of teacher management practice in camp schools with national regulations and standards in support of durable solutions.

This case study, funded by Dubai Cares, forms part of a multi-country study into primary teacher management in refugee settings in five countries. The research objectives for the Kenya case study are to i) understand Kenya’s international, regional, and national commitments to the inclusion of refugees into the national education system and their implications on teacher management in refugee camp settings; and ii) identify promising strategies for further development.

Using an iterative, collaborative, and mixed methods approach, the core research team, along with designated Ministry of Education (MOE) officials, research partner Research Plus and in collaboration with UNHCR, undertook data collection in three phases. During Phase I, an understanding of the landscape was built through a literature and strategy review, and interviews at the national level. During
Phase II, 811 primary school teachers were surveyed, and Phase III involved interviews with implementing organizations at the regional and camp level, with government agencies at the county level, and with teachers through focus group discussions.

The research process has been underpinned by the goal of ensuring that the evidence generated is relevant, useful, and will be utilised by those involved in teacher management in refugee settings. To this end, the research team and UN agencies reworked the initial concept note to ensure that the evidence gathered was needed and useful to inform future planning. Throughout the process, the research team made efforts to share plans, interview tools, preliminary findings, and draft reports with those directly involved in camp management to affirm that the research was aligned with the end goal of inclusion. Three MOE officials have also been regularly consulted, have directly participated in fieldwork in Kakuma, and have reviewed drafts to both increase government ownership and ensure alignment with government priorities around durable solutions. Finally, after writing draft findings, a workshop of over 30 stakeholders from 15 organisations involved in camp education provision was held to gather practical and actionable recommendations for the short, medium, and long term.

Evidence and Outcomes

There is evidence of promising practice in terms of unqualified refugee teachers having opportunities to gain teaching qualifications. However, a lack of longer-term external funding has already resulted in fewer opportunities, and risks reducing the number of refugee teachers with qualifications in the future.

Opportunities to gain qualifications in Primary Teacher Education, Early Childhood Development, and Special Needs Education (SNE)

In recent years, unqualified refugee teachers have had the opportunity to receive in-service training to gain a Diploma in Primary Teacher Education, or a Certificate in Early Childhood Development, or Special Needs Education (SNE), although these are not recognised by the national Teacher Service Commission. These courses have been delivered through Kenyan institutions such as Masinde Muliro University and the Kenya Institute of Special Education (KISE). As well as enabling refugee teachers to progress and receive higher incentives as a result of being categorised as trained teachers, interviews found that such qualifications also opened up opportunities in their home countries. Some qualifications were reported to have been recognised in regions of Somalia, and the Special Needs Education specialist in Dadaab noted that, after training 50 refugee teachers, 30 had returned to Somalia. This result supports durable solutions as outlined in Kenya’s Support for Host Community and Refugee Empowerment (SHARE) strategy and the Djibouti Declaration.

Lack of predictable long-term funding

A lack of funding for longer term trainings has resulted in some courses being put on hold. For example, the SNE qualification takes an academic year to gain (teachers study during the holidays), but whilst the Memorandum of Understanding is still apparently in place there are currently only funds to support shorter-term trainings of around five days.

One possible explanation for the lack of longer-term financial support, raised in stakeholder interviews, is that there are donor misconceptions about their role post-inclusion. Despite Kenya having stated in the 2019 Global Refugee Forum that the extent to which inclusion will be implemented is ‘subject to the provision of funding by the international community,’ there is reportedly a widespread misunderstanding amongst donors that their financial and technical support will not be needed in a system where camp schools are managed by the government. This, together with uncertainty around the future of camps, may have contributed to a decrease in longer-term financial planning for camp teachers.
Preliminary recommendations

To move away from the current parallel system towards inclusion as per Kenya’s Comprehensive Refugee Response Framework Support for Host Community and Refugee Empowerment (SHARE plan), camp schools should be included in the Teacher Professional Development Framework, introduced in September 2021 across all government schools. If this is not possible, a professional development programme for camp teachers should be developed to align with the government system as far as possible.

To ensure consistent, predictable, and sufficient funding for camp teachers, there should also be awareness raising amongst donors and other organisations of their continued role in support of national durable solutions under the Global Compact of Refugees and SHARE plan. This includes requesting that donors offer coordinated inputs which are aligned with government priorities and strategies.

Limitations, Challenges, and/or Lessons Learned

In terms of the limitations of the case study, only primary-level education was in scope. Therefore, we have not been able to understand teacher management at the pre-primary or secondary level, where teachers may face additional unique challenges.

The impact of COVID-19 has also limited the number of teachers in camps that researchers were able to interview. The field team was unable to access the camps because of quarantine measures in place against the spread of COVID-19 inside Kakuma and Dadaab. Therefore, researchers interviewed teachers over the phone rather than through in-person focus group discussions. At the same time, the phone interviews did enable more in-depth discussions to take place.

References


UNHCR. (2021). Education Data for Refugee Settings in Kenya. UNHCR
2.3 Djibouti Declaration on Education for Refugees, Returnees and Host Communities: Lessons from policy responses of regional institutions in East Africa

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Intergovernmental Authority on Development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Author</td>
<td>Dr Kebede Kassa Tsegaye</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Locations</td>
<td>Djibouti, Ethiopia, Kenya, Somalia, Sudan, South Sudan and Uganda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher Profiles</td>
<td>Refugee and host-community teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Topic</td>
<td>Teacher management</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Background and Context**

Regional institutions play critical roles in strengthening regional cooperation, providing platforms for norm-setting and advocacy, as well as mobilising needed resources for the implementation of agreed commitments. This paper outlines the experience of IGAD (Intergovernmental Authority on Development) in implementing policies that respond to the education needs of refugees, returnees and host communities.

The IGAD region (Djibouti, Ethiopia, Kenya, Somalia, Sudan, South Sudan and Uganda) hosts more than 4 million refugees and 8 million internally displaced persons (UNHCR, 2022). Uganda, Ethiopia, Sudan and Kenya are the major refugees hosting countries. IGAD is thus working with Member States and partners to bring comprehensive and durable solutions to the refugee crisis in the region.

The IGAD Heads of State and Government Summit held in Nairobi in March 2017 urged Member States to “enhance with the support of the international community, education, training and skills development for refugees to reduce their dependence on humanitarian assistance, and prepare them for gainful employment in host communities upon return” (IGAD, 2017). In response to this, the Djibouti Declaration was adopted on 14th December 2017 at the first regional IGAD ministerial conference on education for refugees, returnees and host communities. The Declaration is designed to promote access to quality education for refugees and displaced persons with emphasis on inclusion of refugees into national education systems.

**The Comparative Advantage of Regional Institutions**

The IGAD work on education in general, and refugee education in particular, is guided by its broader mandate to facilitate interstate, regional and international cooperation in promoting social, economic, political and cultural development.

The revised treaty establishing IGAD (2014) encourages Member States to:

- adopt a regional plan for the joint development and utilisation of human resources in terms of knowledge, skills, technological inventiveness and entrepreneurial abilities;
- promote the development of a critical mass of well-trained personnel in all sectors;
- encourage technical and student exchange programmes among the Member States;
- encourage the development of centres of excellence in the Member States.

As a Secretariat, IGAD is mandated to coordinate, facilitate and follow up on the implementation of these commitments.
The Importance of Teacher Development in the Implementation of the Djibouti Declaration

Teacher development is an integral part of the Djibouti Declaration. The Plan of Action adopted with the Declaration urges Member States to:

- Strengthen regional frameworks to promote the inclusion of refugee teachers, and their professional development and certification, in national education systems and support of equivalency. This will include:
  - Facilitation of teacher accreditation and certification across borders;
  - Identification and implementation of methods to fast-track training and certification;
  - Progressively align pay and conditions of service across host community and refugee teachers as it relates to experience and qualifications;
  - Support continuous pre-service and in-service professional development of refugee and host community teachers;
  - Increase gender parity and equalize career progression opportunities among teachers. (IGAD, 2017)

To this end, IGAD has embarked upon a series of consultations with development partners and advocacy among Member States to mainstream teacher training and professional upliftment. Some of the areas of emphasis on teacher development are targeted towards:

- providing refresher courses in teaching skills and classroom management in multicultural, refugee and host-communities;
- facilitating the training of refugee teachers in a cluster of subject matter;
- procuring books and equipment (e.g. laptops and tablets); and
- facilitating teachers’ occasional and guided experience-sharing visits to non-refugee schools, etc.

Ongoing Efforts for Teacher Development in the Context of the Djibouti Declaration

Since the adoption of the Djibouti Declaration in December 2017, IGAD has made numerous efforts to facilitate teacher development in refugee settlements. Some of these include:

Regular consultation with relevant stakeholders

In March 2018, IGAD held an informal consultation meeting with core partners of the Djibouti Declaration in Nairobi, Kenya. At this meeting, partners (UNHCR, EU, UNESCO, IGAD, etc.) agreed to develop a Work Stream Concept Note\(^1\) on the implementation of the Declaration. This was followed by a formal meeting of partners and stakeholders in May 2018 in Addis Ababa. The Work Stream Concept Note was refined and adopted. The Concept Note stressed that:

*In order to improve the quality of education and the ‘maximisation of learning outcomes’ for refugees, returnees and host communities, particular attention needs to be given to teaching quality. This is the most important factor affecting learning. This will need to focus on how to train, recruit and motivate both national teachers in hosting communities and refugee teachers, as well as generating a joint approach to supervision and accountability.* (IGAD, 2018)

---

\(^1\) The Work Stream Concept Note is a sort of roadmap outlining priority intervention areas. It specifies what needs to happen by whom and when as part of the Djibouti Declaration implementation process.
Particular focus is given to this in the Djibouti Action Plan (IGAD, 2017), including the need to facilitate teacher accreditation through fast-tracking training and certification; aligning pay and conditions of services between host community and refugee teachers, and their continuous in-service professional development; and ensure that gender is not a barrier to the employment of teachers.

Exploratory Missions to Refugee Schools in IGAD Member States

To move away from arm-chair policy-making based on secondary (desk review) data, IGAD decided to undertake learning missions to selected refugee schools in Member States. The selection of refugee settlements and schools was made by the host government. IGAD usually communicates intention to conduct the visits to the IGAD focal points in the Ministries of Foreign Affairs of Member States with copies to the national refugee agencies and Ministries of Education. The first round of missions was carried out between February and June 2019: (a) in Djibouti in February 2019 (Holl Hall and Ali Addeh); in Uganda in April 2019 (Bidibidi) and in Kenya in June 2019 (Kakuma/Kalobeyei). In Djibouti, the visit covered two primary schools, one in each settlement. In Uganda, the team visited two primary and two secondary schools. In Kenya, visits included two primary schools, one secondary school, one technical and vocational education and training centre, Masinde Muliro University Turkana West 2, a teaching aid development centre for students with special needs and a girls’ boarding school in Kakuma town which also teaches refugee students. The diversity of the schools from primary to tertiary levels suggests that refugees have ample opportunities to access education at different levels.

The missions had two main objectives: (a) make general observations on the teaching-learning environment in the refugee settings; and (b) identify major challenges and opportunities, including those related to teacher development. The study was more exploratory using observation of the physical situation of schools, classroom facilities, and the socio-natural setting. This was complemented by information gathered through focus group discussions and unstructured interviews with teachers and students, school administrators, and refugee management officials. Though comparison was not the main purpose of the study, common challenges were observed across the three countries as outlined below.

The mission was conducted by this author and a masters student on education from Finland who was working with IGAD as an Intern. The latter focused her study on teacher development as part of her MA thesis research. She analysed the qualitative data in Bidibidi, Uganda, and presented a summary of her findings at the 5th Meeting of IGAD experts in charge of education, held on 4–6 July 2019, in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia 3. The findings were very helpful for the experts meeting since it brought fresh qualitative information to be used in developing costed national response plans 4 for the Djibouti Declaration.

The discussion with teachers and administrators revealed that (a) most teachers are committed to delivering quality education; (b) they see the global, regional and national emphasis on education for refugees, returnees and host communities as important opportunities to both improve the quality of teaching and of their own personal skills/competencies; © they desire to receive training to upgrade their skills including improving their knowledge of specific subjects they teach (especially chemistry, physics, mathematics and biology) and refreshing their pedagogical skills as well as ICT skills; (d) they face challenges related to time, workload due to staff-turnover and mismatch in student-teacher ratio; (e) they consider that they have limited incentives (no salary increases). Moreover, refugees who were teachers in their countries of origin find it difficult to get their qualifications recognized and deployed as full teachers. Instead, the majority of them serve as support staff or teaching assistants, serving as bridges between the principal teacher and students speaking other languages.

---

2 This Campus was under construction in Kalobeyei during the visit, expected to be completed before the end of 2019.
3 Ms. Pinja Fort left IGAD in July 2019.
4 The Djibouti Declaration requires Member States to develop a costed national response plan for the integration of refugees into national education systems. This includes plans for teacher development.
Planning for Teacher Training

Based on the lessons from the field visits, IGAD has identified teacher professional development and training as one of the most crucial needs for teachers in displacement settings. Therefore, efforts are underway to facilitate training by partners in collaboration with UNHCR, Member States, and others. The first round of training is expected to take place in Uganda and will address innovative learning solutions. IGAD is working closely with the International Centre of Excellence for Innovative Learning (ICEFIL) to launch the training. Other partners, like the Global E-School Community Initiative (GESCI), have expressed interest in providing the training. IGAD will engage different stakeholders, notably teacher training institutions in Member States, to expand the training programs.

Partnership Building Efforts

Over the last two years, IGAD has made serious efforts to engage relevant partners and stakeholders at every step of the implementation process of the Djibouti Declaration. In addition to the core partners (EU, UNHCR, and GIZ), IGAD has brought several partners on board including UNESCO, Education Cannot Wait (ECW), the Global Partnership for Education (GPE), Save the Children, UNICEF, GeSCI (Global e-School Community Initiative), ICEFI, the World Bank, the Islamic Development Bank (IsDB), etc. IGAD has signed Memoranda of Understanding (MoU) with some of these and is in the process of doing so with others. Funding requests have been submitted to partners which have expressed interest in supporting the Djibouti Declaration.

Opportunities, Challenges and Recommendations

Emerging Opportunities

The Djibouti Declaration provides ample opportunities for teacher development in general and supporting teachers in emergency situations, in particular. The existence of high level political commitments in the form of declarations and strategic frameworks encourage Member States, refugee management agencies, academic and research institutions, humanitarian and development agencies, regional organisations, etc., to coordinate their efforts for stronger teacher development and enhancing access to quality education for refugees, returnees and host communities.

In other words, the Djibouti Declaration has provided impetus to see education for refugees, returnees and host communities as developmental, not merely as a humanitarian concern. Therefore, there is greater awareness on the importance of responding to the needs of these population groups from a long term perspective. Greater emphasis is placed on inclusion of refugee education into national systems. Governance structures and enabling frameworks are put in place. IGAD has been working closely with Member States and partners to develop Costed National Education Response Plans (CNERP). Uganda has already adopted its CNERP. Ethiopia, South Sudan, Somalia and Kenya have also made substantial progress in the preparation of CNERP or policies for a comprehensive response. These include teacher development: in-service and regular training programs; improved incentive structures to retain teachers; certification and recognition of their competencies; and providing psychosocial support for teachers and students.

Regional institutions, like IGAD, may not have adequate resources to respond to the needs of teachers as well as students in displacement settings. However, they can use their convening power, ability to harmonise policy and coordinate efforts to bring durable solutions to the challenges facing education, including those related to building improved skills among teachers. These are immense opportunities. Similarly, regional institutions can mobilise resources and provide vital support to countries that have capacity limitations in order to mobilise enough resources. Some of the countries such as Somalia, South Sudan, and Sudan have restricted access to funding from some international financial institu-
tions, a problem that may be alleviated through regional or third-party interventions. Moreover, regional institutions can compile and disseminate best practices from different Member States that can be used to trigger positive action in other countries. Such comparative advantages can make a difference.

**Challenges**

The obvious challenges facing IGAD in the implementation of the Djibouti Declaration include limited resources (human and financial); weak response of international funding agencies to invest in education for refugees, returnees and host communities; commitments not supported by meaningful actions among a number of partners; tough time to convince partners on the role of regional institutions such as IGAD in providing policy space and facilitating implementation; and tendencies among some partners to use the Djibouti Declaration for institutional gains, not for supporting IGAD.

**Recommendations**

The regional institutions like IGAD have unique comparative advantages in shaping collective responses to challenges faced by their Member States. Refugee issues being cross-cutting and transnational in nature, call for coordinated action and collaborative efforts. The lessons generated from the implementation of the Djibouti Declaration suggest that countries can tackle problems related to refugee education, including teacher development, when they join hands and learn from each other. IGAD will continue to provide leadership in all these and will be glad to strengthen partnership with all relevant actors and stakeholders.
2.4 What policies and implementation strategies exist for the effective management of teachers in refugee contexts in Ethiopia?

Description of Crisis-Specific Challenge

Ethiopia is home to one of the largest refugee populations in Africa. An early adopter of the global Comprehensive Refugee Response Framework (CRRF), the country is known for its willingness to welcome and protect refugees, including in the education sector, where the government has committed to improving access for refugees.

While Ethiopia has plans to expand its out-of-camp policy, most refugees continue to reside in camps administered by the Agency for Refugee and Returnee Affairs (ARRA). ARRA is also primarily responsible for the delivery of several essential services within the camps, including primary education, making Ethiopia a unique research setting, as there are two different governmental agencies responsible for primary education: the Ministry of Education (MoE) for host-community schools and ARRA for refugee camp schools.

The strengths and weaknesses of both the MoE and ARRA’s ways of training, recruiting, and retaining teachers to staff their respective systems need to be carefully analyzed to support teacher management policies benefiting both refugees and the host communities in which they live. Through in-depth policy analysis, this research aims to break down this boundary between host and refugee and produce meaningful, relevant, and practical guidance for the Ethiopian government and other key stakeholders.

Brief Overview

Most refugee children will spend their entire childhood in exile. Responding to their educational needs will require innovative policy solutions that put teachers at the centre, not just because teachers are often the only educational resource available to learners during crisis, but because teachers are themselves rights-holders as members of affected communities. To help advance this search for innovative policy solutions, UNESCO International Institute for Educational Planning (IIEP), together with EdDevTrust, has launched a multi-country research project on teacher management policies in refugee contexts, with a pilot study in Ethiopia supported by UNICEF Ethiopia.

For the purposes of this research, the core aim of effective teacher management policy is to nurture and sustain a thriving body of great teachers who facilitate quality teaching and learning for all by:

- Providing meaningful opportunities for intra- and interpersonal and professional growth
- Improving employment and career conditions
The research uses an iterative, collaborative, mixed methods approach to explore how teachers’ management policies are being developed, communicated, interpreted, mediated, struggled over, and implemented at national, regional, and local levels. Our research partners included PRIN International Consultancy and Research Services (an Ethiopian company), IPSOS Kenya, master’s students from the McCourt School of Public Policy, and two independent consultants. During the whole research process, the research team worked closely with key stakeholders from Ethiopia including ARRA, MoE, UNHCR, and UNICEF. Data collection in Ethiopia was undertaken in three phases between September 2018 and May 2019. During Phase I, an understanding of the policy landscape was built through a literature review, an analysis of policy documents and EMIS data, and semi-structured interviews with key stakeholders at the federal level. Phase II involved interviews with government and international agencies at regional, zonal, and woreda(district) levels, interviews and focus group discussions with teachers at refugee and host-community schools, and a teacher survey from a mix of schools in refugee-hosting woredas. During Phase III, we conducted stakeholder consultations and follow-up interviews with participants from Phase I and II to discuss and validate preliminary findings, interviews with key stakeholders not interviewed in earlier rounds, and one-day case studies at selected schools in each region.

Evidence and Outcomes

In addition to a thorough policy document review, this study has generated rich qualitative data capturing a range of stakeholder perspectives on policies related to teacher status, well-being, personal and professional growth, and working conditions. Comprehensive survey data have been collected from 351 Ethiopian and refugee teachers in refugee and host schools in refugee-hosting woredas in Benishangul-Gumuz, Gambella, and Tigray.

Key findings emerging from the data analysis suggest that while Ethiopia has developed promising policy texts for the effective management of teachers in refugee-hosting communities, problems with communication, interpretation, and implementation remain. These problems stem from underdeveloped relationships between stakeholders, particularly at regional level, and a lack of clarity around roles and responsibilities.

These issues are compounded by significant contextual variations. While Tigray’s economy is relatively strong, and relationships between Eritrean refugees and host communities relatively good, Benishangul-Gumuz and Gambella are emerging regions facing major resource constraints, and refugees from South Sudan and Sudan have less in common with host communities.
Barriers to meaningful opportunities for intra- and interpersonal and professional growth

One major challenge we identified was how the lack of teaching qualifications amongst refugee teachers meant that, regardless of other qualifications, they did not know the basics of pedagogy, teaching methodologies, or pedagogical content knowledge (PCK). In response to this, an upgrading programme has been launched in two regions, funded through the Education Cannot Wait fund. This programme consists of summer training at Colleges of Teacher Education (CTEs) over four years, after which the refugee teachers will graduate with a diploma. So far 350 refugees have completed two summers of study.

Inconducive employment and career conditions

However, through our research it also became apparent that challenges remain around progression and compensation for refugee teachers. Until the recent Refugee Proclamation, refugees have been unable to legally work in Ethiopia, meaning that they are paid a small ‘incentive’ funded by UNHCR rather than a salary. All Refugees earn the same small amount (less than 20% of what their Ethiopian colleagues at refugee schools earn). There are no opportunities to progress or to be paid more – even the refugee vice-directors of schools earn the same as other refugee teachers. Linking this to the example of professional development above, it means that even those refugee teachers who will graduate from the CTEs with a diploma will not return to a higher paid or promoted position.

We also found that a significant factor which negatively affects the working conditions of refugee teachers is the overcrowding in refugee schools and subsequent high pupil teacher ratio (PTR). Whereas most host community schools visited reported a PTR of around 40:1, within the standard Ethiopian guidelines, the PTR at refugee schools was extremely high, from between 80:1 to 120:1. This was partly due to refugee primary schools admitting students of any age and partly due to the instability of the region as a whole, which resulted in influxes of refugees. At one school visited there were over 6,000 students on roll with one head teacher and a total of 69 teachers; a total PTR of 89:1 and a PTR of qualified national teachers to students of 280:1. The high PTR had a profound effect on the quality of teaching that teachers felt able to provide, with it being reported that even taking the register took up to 15 minutes of a 40-minute lesson.

Implications for well-being and motivation

Poor compensation and tough working conditions have implications for motivation; to both work as a teacher and to undertake additional study. Although the majority of refugee teachers cited a sense of commitment to the community as a reason to teach, we found that in some reasons there were challenges in recruiting refugee teachers due to the workload teaching entailed. With all other jobs available to refugees in the camps paying the same amount, even refugees who had qualified as teachers in their home country were, at times, reluctant to teach in a camp due to the additional preparation and marking time to which they needed to commit. Basically, they could do an ‘easier’ job for the same amount of money.

Historically, policy development and planning have been undertaken separately for refugees and host communities, but there is an increasing recognition of the importance of joint policies and planning that are responsive to the local context. In the words of one UNHCR representative, “We need to work together so that such disparities can be avoided, and that is only when we have the data that show the disparities” (Interview, March 2019).

Our findings on Ethiopia will be published as a policy brief and in-depth case study, including a set of practical policy recommendations, which have been revised based on inputs from ARRA, MoE, UNHCR, and other stakeholders. In keeping with our iterative approach, we shared preliminary findings with key stakeholders, and these will feed into the development of Ethiopia’s new Education Sector Development Plan.
Limitations, Challenges, and/or Lessons Learned

Overall, an iterative, collaborative approach involving multiple field visits allowed for the generation of rich data. However, we faced challenges, which will be considered as research continues:

- Our research proved timely, commencing just as Ethiopia started rolling out the CRRF and overhauling teacher management policies. However, analysing policy frameworks and policy networks while these policies are being developed and revised has proven challenging.
- While Ethiopia is relatively stable, security issues did arise, which meant that some schools could not be visited during our fieldwork.
- Developing policy guidance that can be used by a range of stakeholders is a challenge, but one we have tried to mitigate by soliciting feedback throughout the process.

Relevant Links

- Teachers of refugees: A review of the literature
- Who teaches refugees? Policy study launches in Ethiopia
- What We Know and What We Need to Know: Identifying and Addressing Evidence Gaps to Support Effective Teacher Management Policies in Refugee Settings in Ethiopia
2.5 A systemic approach to teacher development – the UNRWA way

Organizations
United National Relief and Works Agency for Palestine Refugees (UNRWA)

Authors
Dr. Caroline Pontefract and Frosse Dabit

Locations
Gaza, Jordan, Lebanon, Syria and the West Bank

Teacher Profile
Refugee teachers

Topic
Teacher management

Description of Crisis-Specific Challenge

The context in which UNRWA provides education in each of its five Fields of operation presents both generic and specific challenges which have to be taken into account in its planning. In Gaza, the situation remains volatile, with recurrent hostilities and an ongoing blockade entering its twelfth year. In the West Bank, refugees continue to experience difficult socioeconomic conditions, often due to occupation-related policies and practices. In Syria, UNRWA estimates that the ongoing conflict has left 95% of Palestine refugees in critical need of sustained humanitarian assistance. Lebanon too has faced the challenges of an influx of Syrian and Palestine refugees from Syria (PRS), with Palestine refugees having high rates of poverty, limited employment opportunities, and being deeply dependent on UNRWA services. More recently, weeks of political upheaval and demonstrations has led to UNRWA, and Governmental school closure. In Jordan, Palestine refugees suffer from the high costs of living, high poverty levels and overcrowding in the camps. Throughout these challenges UNRWA, however, has ensured the provision of education for Palestine refugee students.

Although the UNRWA Education Programme had achieved a good reputation, likely reflecting the support of UNESCO from the early 1950s, an independent external review of the UNRWA Education Programme in 2009 highlighted the need for change. It described a teaching model that was didactic, with teacher-based classroom practices unlikely to support the development of students’ 21st century skills. This review further highlighted the need for strengthening the professional development of teachers and ensuring the provision of ongoing professional support to both teachers and school leaders. Moreover, the lack of agency-wide policies, strategies, and evidence-based approaches were considered to be negatively impacting on the potential of the education programme to support the learning needs of all UNRWA students. This evaluation served as a springboard for the UNRWA Education Department to lead an Agency-wide systemic programme reform from 2011 to 2016.

Brief Overview

The Education Reform sought to strengthen the UNRWA education system and to this effect it addressed three key levels – policy, strategy/structural, and individual capacity development. Interrelated but defined programmatic areas were also determined relating to teachers, curriculum, student assessment, student inclusion and well-being. Strengthened planning, monitoring and evaluation, and measurement of impact underpinned the whole reform and throughout the role of the teacher was central.

To explicitly address this central role, an UNRWA Teacher Policy was developed; this provides a framework for teacher management, their professional development, career progression, and well-being. In so doing, the policy seeks to strengthen both the day-to-day, and the longer term professional support system. Teacher Toolkits, such as those for Inclusive Education and Human Rights and Conflict Resolution and Tolerance, and the flagship School-Based Teacher Development (SBTD) and Leading for the Future (LftF) programmes help teachers better cope with the challenges they face. The reform
approach to teacher development was innovative in that it enabled teachers to learn in situ, alongside their peers and have the overall responsibility for their own development. However, they are supported throughout to reflect on their own practice, learn about new pedagogies and their impact on children’s learning, and try out new ideas and approaches.

Another key area of the Teacher Policy is career progression, with successful completion of substantive professional development programmes, alongside other key criteria (years in profession and overall performance evaluation), now leads to staff ‘grade’ enhancement. Teacher management and support was also strengthened through Field-based professional structures, i.e., the Strategic Support Units and these are the Quality Assurance Unit, the Assessment Unit, and the Professional Development and Curriculum Unit.

In this way the Teacher Policy and its different strands have directly impacted teacher well-being through career progression and better professional support, but also through the Communities of Practice that have developed as teachers undertake professional development together. In Syria for instance, the UNRWA teachers were determined to move forward with the study of the SBTD programme despite the conflict. They reported later that the peer discussions played a key role in helping them cope better with the impact of the conflict on their work.

**Evidence and Outcomes**

Reflecting the broader Education Reform and its emphasis on monitoring and evaluation of the Education programme as a whole, the progress and impact of the Teacher Policy is continuously measured at both system and programmatic level. At the system level, UNRWA monitors, evaluates, and measures progress and achievements through the Agency-wide Common Monitoring Framework (CMF). Within the CMF there are universal education indicators at both Outcome and Output levels. At ‘outcome’ level, a Classroom Observation study was developed and implemented with a partner university; this looks at the nature of teaching and learning practices in classrooms. At the ‘output’ level, indicators measure the prevalence of human rights culture and practices in classrooms and the overall equity of educational learning outcomes.

Evidence of the impact of the holistic focus on teachers through the reform, and now the UNRWA Medium Term Strategy, is indicated by these student learning outcomes which have improved in all grades and subjects and across all domains (content, cognitive, and higher order thinking skills). The percentage of students reaching the “Achieved” or “Advanced” levels in grade 8 Maths increased by 35% over this period. Similarly, the Perceptual Survey showed improvement in teachers’ enjoyment of teaching, teacher motivation, and stakeholders’ perceptions of classroom practices.

The newly established UNRWA School Quality Assurance process was developed once the reform was in place. It focuses on measuring the performance of the schools and its teachers with regard to all aspects that had been addressed over the previous years, from student well-being to parental engagement.

There has been recognition of the quality and innovation of the UNRWA Education Reform by the Host countries, the region, and even at a global level among education stakeholders. The World Bank 2014 report, “Learning in the Face of Adversity”, describes the strong results of the UNRWA Education Programme in terms of its quality, inclusiveness, and equity. The UNRWA Education in Emergencies approach was showcased as a “promising practice” in refugee education in the initiative led by UNHCR, Pearson, and Save the Children at a side event at the UN General Assembly in 2017. More recently, an external performance assessment commissioned by several top donors, through the Multilateral Organisation Performance Assessment Network (MOPAN), commended the agency for its systemic reform in education and said that it is “characterised by a high technical competence,” efficiency, and quality (MOPAN 2019, 7).
Limitations, Challenges, and/or Lessons Learned

A holistic, overarching approach to teacher development, teacher management, professional development, career progression, and well-being is what makes the difference with regards to a quality education system.

There have been some challenges with regard to the implementation of this holistic approach. These could be said to be of a financial, administrative, political, and professional nature. The instability of the operating environment continues to impact the implementation of the Teacher Policy; the recurrent financial challenges that the agency faces has led to an increase in class size, a reduction in education posts, and an increase in daily paid teachers. These various challenges have also led to uncertainty among the Palestine refugee community, not only because of the threat they pose to the provision of quality education by UNRWA, but also for what they see as the wider implications with regard to the future of the agency and themselves as Palestine refugees. Despite these challenges UNRWA and the UNRWA education continues to strive for quality, inclusive, and equitable education by investing in its teachers.

References


Relevant Links

- UNRWA Teacher Policy
- UNRWA School Based Teacher Development programme
- UNRWA Annual Operational Report 2018
- Learning in the Face of Adversity: The UNRWA Education Program for Palestine Refugees
- MOPAN 2017-2018 Assessments: The United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestine refugees in the Near East (UNRWA)
New Generation Teacher Training Center (NG-TTC) is a joint partnership between the Catholic Diocese of Myitkyina’s Diocesan Commission for Education (DCE) and the Jesuit Refugee Service (JRS) to address the lack of skilled teachers in Kachin State, Myanmar. NG-TTC combines pre-service training, field-based practicum, and two years of continuous professional development for volunteer teachers in IDP camps and communities in conflict-affected areas.

Internal conflicts have resulted in over 401,000 people being displaced within Myanmar. Though a Nationwide Ceasefire Agreement was signed in 2015, several ethnic armed organizations (EAOs) have not signed the document and continue to engage in conflict with the Burmese army.

Kachin State is divided between government-controlled areas (GCAs) and non-government-controlled areas (NGCAs) controlled by EAOs. Access to quality education is limited in these remote areas; according to a 2017 UN report, 35,525 people lacked access to education. Furthermore, each NGCA has its own unique education system and challenges. There are significant teacher shortages across all school levels. Government teachers are often reluctant to go to GCAs due to their remoteness and proximity to ongoing conflicts, and they are barred from entering NGCAs. Humanitarian agencies face similar barriers to service-delivery in NGCAs.

Church-based organizations, such as DCE, have recruited and sent volunteers to remote and conflict-affected schools in Kachin for many years over the course of the decades-long conflict. However, NG-TTC is unique as a comprehensive preparation and in-service training program in Kachin – previously, the training period for volunteer teachers before deployment lasted anywhere from one week to one month. In light of this, the Diocese and JRS embarked on the NG-TTC partnership to enhance the training program and improve the overall quality of education.

Brief Overview

NG-TTC began in 2014 as a collaboration between JRS Myanmar and the Diocesan Commission for Education-Myitkyina (DCE). Each year, DCE recruits and selects volunteers from host and IDP communities through the local church network to serve as teachers in IDP camps and communities in community-based schools managed by DCE and ethnic armed groups. Most of these volunteers (88%) come from Kachin State; 28% are IDPs themselves, while the remainder come from areas that are conflict-affected but have not experienced displacement. Most volunteers are female (77%), and the average age is 21 years. The level of education among volunteers varies: 17% are university graduates, 32% have passed secondary matriculation exams and continue to higher education after their teaching service, and 49% have not passed secondary matriculation exams. Several factors drive volunteers’ motivation to teach. Mostly they are motivated by a desire to contribute to long-term
development of the area. Some volunteers also see school as an important tool by which to prevent children’s recruitment into armed groups, and therefore see teaching as a form of peacebuilding.

During their term of service with NG-TTC, trainees receive the following supports:

**Seven months of pre-service training**

Before placement, teachers attend seven months of classroom-based training. Sources for the training curriculum include TICC Teacher Training Package, Myanmar’s Teacher Competency Standards Framework, and JRS’ global Teacher Formation Package, among others. The training curriculum addresses issues facing children in Kachin, including youth migration, human trafficking, mine-risk education, environmental awareness, and peacebuilding and reconciliation.

A Basic English Course was introduced in 2017 to help improve teaching in English classes. Trainees live in a community in a boarding house, learning cooking and cleaning skills they will need during their teaching placements in remote areas. As many of the trainees are themselves adolescents, this structured programme provides important personal value formation in addition to learning the practical independent living skills they will need to thrive while teaching in remote areas.

**Two months of teaching practicum in IDP camps**

Trainees are placed in an IDP camp near the training centre, where they plan and deliver a summer course for students.

**Two-year placements in IDP camps and community schools**

Teachers are placed by DCE in coordination with parish priests and local officials. Teachers receive safety briefings before placements, and are accompanied to their placements by DCE staff, where they are introduced to camp and school leaders. The local community provides housing and in-kind food support for the teachers.

**Continuous school-based monitoring during volunteers’ two-year placements**

DCE and JRS staff conduct joint monitoring visits to different geographic zones, where they conduct observation and feedback of each teacher’s classroom practice. The remoteness of placements makes this model time-consuming, and monitoring visits can last up to one month. Also, teachers only receive this observation/feedback twice per year, which isn’t enough to impact their practice. Therefore, while joint monitoring visits continue, a new approach has been introduced to train head teachers to conduct more frequent observation/feedback at their schools, combined with a teacher self-evaluation to provide a more holistic picture of teacher practice. This has made the process more efficient and involving the head teacher in the monitoring has improved feedback, since they know individual teachers’ skills and attitudes better than external monitors. However, this requires more robust training of head teachers to properly conduct observation/feedback cycles. It also places additional demands on head teachers, who also have regular teaching duties themselves.

**Ongoing in-service training during school holidays**

NG-TTC staff provide in-service training for volunteer teachers and their community teacher colleagues. These sessions are based on data from staff monitoring visits. The sessions also provide a forum for teachers to come together, share experiences, and provide both instructional and psychosocial support to one another.

**Structured On-Ramp to Government-level Teacher Competency**

Since 2018, JRS and the NG-TTC have worked with Fordham University to implement a standardized Teacher Professional Development Competency Framework (TPDF) aligned to the Myanmar Teacher Competency Standards Framework for Beginning Teachers. The framework defines a learning pathway for teachers working in an emergency context, including the knowledge, skills, and dispositions evident, in five levels of proficiency based on criteria (Lester, 2005). The TPDF draws from the national framework to define its standards, minimum requirements, and indicators. The first phase
of development of the TPDF included focus-group discussions with teachers and teacher-educators in Kachin and Kayah state, Myanmar, as well as other key education stakeholders. A comparative analysis was conducted, looking at Myanmar’s national teacher competency framework as well as eight other national and supranational competency frameworks to augment the emergency-specific competencies. Finally, an analysis was conducted of the TiCC Teacher Training Packages and Competency List, as well as existing professional development frameworks utilized within the project and by JRS globally. Findings from the FGDs and analysis informed the development of the TPDF, which is now undergoing validation by a wider collection of teachers, teacher-educators, and JRS education staff.

Evidence and Outcomes

Since its inception, JRS has regularly monitored the NG-TTC, collecting data on teachers’ progress throughout the pre-service curriculum and their teaching service. In 2018, a mixed-method external evaluation utilizing focus groups, informant and participant interviews, and a desk review of project data found that since 2014, NG-TTC enrolled a total of 88 students for its pre-service training, 81 have completed their training and at least one year of teaching service. The average term of service for teachers in placement schools was two years.

Volunteer teachers described the experience of teaching in remote areas as very positive, citing factors such as being able to adapt and be creative with the resources available in their schools, learning the real-life situations and struggles in those areas, and becoming advocates for these marginalized communities. Annual requests for NG-TTC teachers consistently exceed supply, with NG-TTC able to fill roughly 20% of positions. Current volunteers and alumni reported that the most important areas of pedagogical training were lesson planning, strategies to motivate and engage students, and child-centred and active teaching methods. Alumni also noted the role their volunteer experience played in their own future career development. Some cited the personal growth and skills gained during their teaching placement: greater self-awareness, self-confidence, and social skills. Some teachers have stayed beyond their placement, and others have continued to other educational roles: government teacher (those few with university degrees), private tuition teacher, or pursuing higher education. JRS has partnerships with two higher education partners in Yangon to which it can refer some NG-TTC alumni who wish to pursue further studies, but the cost of living and studies in Yangon is prohibitive for many. A small number of spots in local education institutes have also been negotiated for NG-TTC alumni to pursue certificate/diploma programs.

Limitations, Challenges, and/or Lessons Learned

Through the Catholic Church, NG-TTC can reach areas where others cannot due to conflict, including UN agencies and INGOs. One implication is that faith-based networks are active partners in providing quality education in places where formal authorities may be fragile. NG-TTC does not have formal certification. Partnership with a certifying institution is desired, but volunteers lack the prerequisites for such programs: passing the 10th grade matriculation examination, and in private institutes, possessing strong English language skills.

Many alumni wish to become government teachers, but presently there are no pathways or government policy that grants them recognition for their years of service through NG-TTC. This is an ongoing point of advocacy between the government and NGO partners. The government’s National Education Sector Plan (NESP) notes several areas for ongoing teacher education reform, including: “An ‘open system’ of pre-service teacher education provision, whereby different TEIs, potentially including private sector institutions, offer different degree specializations” (GoUM NESP 2016, 146).
“An ‘open system’ of pre-service teacher education provision, whereby different TEIs, potentially including private sector institutions, offer different degree specializations” (GoUM NESP 2016, 146).

“An improved system for the deployment of teachers working in rural and border areas... to attract experienced and qualified teachers to them...include[ing] recognition of prior learning, so that teachers who have taught indifferent educational contexts (for example, in monastic schools and in refugee camps) can have their qualifications recognised in Myanmar” (GoUM NESP 2016, 144).

References


Description of Crisis-Specific Challenge

Ensuring high-quality formal schooling at scale is difficult under the best of circumstances. In the case of Lebanon, a country dealing with a large influx of refugee children affected by violence and conflict - resulting in the doubling of the student population within four years - such a task presents a near-insurmountable challenge.

In response to this unprecedented influx of refugees, billions of dollars and hundreds of international humanitarian agencies and NGOs have flowed into Lebanon. While many beneficial programs have been implemented within the education sector, efficiency in providing quality education has suffered from fragmented coordination both within and across agencies. In addition, many NGOs’ solution of utilizing pre-packaged, trademarked curricular packages—optimized to implement quickly, under crisis conditions—hinders programs’ integration into the existing educational frameworks in more protracted crises.

The education in emergencies field, where there are great needs for efficient and rapid provision of effective services, needs to move from fragmented service provision of pre-packaged, inflexible curricula to evidence-based “essential ingredients” of educational interventions that can be easily adapted and integrated into multiple contexts. Our study investigates a teacher and coach professional development approach that is flexible, easily integrated into existing school curricula, and agnostic with regard to curricular approach.

Brief Overview

Actors, partners, context, target population:

In the 2019-2020 school year, the Lebanese Ministry of Education and Higher Education (MEHE), with the equipped with competence in core teaching practices to implement a new concept or curriculum. However, it is often the case that teachers in crisis settings lack basic training and skills, impeding their ability to successfully implement interventions. For example, we found in our multi-country initiative (inclusive of Lebanon) designed to test the effectiveness of low-cost, targeted social-emotional learning activities that a critical part of the intervention’s theory of change was either omitted entirely or poorly-performed by teachers across all country contexts due to lack of teacher comfort with core instructional practices such as conducting classroom conversations (3EA, 2018). Utilizing a flexible and adaptable approach - one that can endure as curricular approaches shift and change - this study seeks to find educational solutions to crisis contexts that can integrate at scale.
The program

We focus our study on the development of a set core teacher practices: high-leverage practices that (1) occur with high frequency in teaching, (2) cut across different curricula or instructional approaches, (3) are research-based, and (4) have the potential to improve student achievement (McDonald, Kazemi, & Kavanaugh, 2013).

In Lebanon, a set of pilot teacher practices (Instructional Dialogue, Critical Thinking, and Metacognition) were derived from the existing Lebanese Teacher Competency Framework by a subset of DOPS Coaches and Coordinators. The working group then utilized video captured from Lebanese classrooms to create a quality spectrum (i.e., an observation tool) of each pilot focal practice, to be used as the foundation of classroom observations and feedback for the duration of the study. The utilization of this DOPS-developed tool is both to create a shared vision and language of teacher instruction within DOPS as well as to encourage a more coherent and standardized professional development experience for teachers across content areas and grade levels.

Existing DOPS coaches within the eligible grade levels and subject areas in the treatment condition will attend a total of seven days of training on the use of the DOPS observation tool and pedagogical/coaching strategies for each focal practice. Trainings are co-constructed and co-facilitated by DOPS subject area coordinators, in order to increase institutional ownership, contextual fit, and sustainability of the program. Trained coaches will hold monthly coaching sessions with teachers, focusing on the pilot core practices and utilizing the newly-developed observation tool.

Evidence and Outcomes

In the U.S. and other developed contexts, research has demonstrated that teachers’ instruction is responsive to professional development on core practices (Cohen et al., 2016) and that teachers who perform core practices at higher levels increase student gains on rigorous assessments (Grossman et al., 2014). However, to our knowledge, there has been little to no research on whether these effects extend to emergency or LMIC contexts.

The current study focuses on experimentally assessing the impact of a core-practice based professional development approach at the coach and teacher level, given: (1) coaches’ pivotal role in supporting teachers; (2) the dearth of research on how to support effective coaching; and (3) the challenges coaches face in providing quality services to teachers, particularly when coaching services are scaled to the systems level (Kraft et al., 2018).

Primarily, the research will test the causal impact of an improved teacher professional development coaching system based on contextualized, flexible core practices compared to the business-as-usual condition. Specific outcomes include coach satisfaction and content knowledge, observed teacher instructional practice, and student perceptions of teacher quality. Two observation tools will be utilized in the study to understand the critical role of classroom processes: the validated Protocol for Language Arts Teaching Observations (Grossman et al., 2013), as well as the newly-developed DOPS-created tool. Utilizing both data sets will allow us to investigate the psychometric properties of the DOPS tool.

Data on coach attendance at trainings, frequency of teacher coaching sessions, and utilization of core-practice based activities/strategies will be collected to understand the critical importance of implementation quality and quantity, including its potential downstream effects on impacts. In addition to this quantitative data collection, focal groups will be held with coaches and teachers to better understand participants’ experience with the new coaching system, inclusive of its affordances and constraints.
Limitations, Challenges, and/or Lessons Learned

One challenge has been the historical separation of mandates within the government of Lebanon. In-service teachers’ trainings are led by the Center for Educational Research and Development (CERD). However, CERD does not have the mandate to provide follow-up support to teachers in schools; that is in the mandate of counsellors from the DOPS. Thus, coaches are often not aware of the content of trainings and do not have access to resources to reinforce the goals thereof. This creates considerable misalignment within the teacher professional development system.

A second challenge has been the sheer quantity and competing interests of multiple agencies working with the MEHE. In the absence of planning and coordination within the sector, teachers and coaches are over-extended, unclear about priority practices, and struggle to find the time and space to implement them with quality. These competing priorities have reduced the availability of DOPS coaches and subject coordinators for trainings and workshops as well as the intervention period as a whole. Though research indicates that teachers require approximately 50 hours of professional development to acquire new practices (Yoon et al. 2007), the combined hours of training, practice, and supported implementation will likely fall short of that threshold in this intervention.

References


Description of Crisis-Specific Challenge

Extreme variations in staffing between schools in urban areas and those in remote areas are common in sub-Saharan Africa. This leaves schools in remote areas, including many serving refugee and IDP populations, facing severe and chronic shortages of teachers and other education personnel, a key contributor to Africa’s Learning crisis.

Malawi is an extreme example: Malawi spends more than 80% of its basic education budget on teachers salaries, but its 61,000 primary school teachers are very unevenly distributed between schools. Within a single district, school pupil-teacher ratios (PTRs) can vary from below 10 students per teacher to above 1,000 in extreme cases. Remote schools also typically have fewer facilities and poorer students, and these staffing gaps exacerbate existing inequities in the system.

Nathenje zone, near the capital city of Lilongwe, demonstrates how PTRs can vary enormously within a small area. Nsanjiko primary is based in a small village, 10km up a dirt road from Nathenje town. The village boasts a handful of small shops, but lacks electricity, piped water, or health facilities. Two of the school’s teachers live on site; the remainder travel to school on foot or by bicycle either from Nathenje or along a back road from Lilongwe itself.

The school has contended with understaffing since 2013, when four female teachers were allowed to transfer away after experiencing crime while cycling to the school from Lilongwe. The headteacher granted permission for the four to leave on the condition that they be replaced, but no replacements were made available. Since then, new teachers have arrived but others have left owing to marriage or medical issues. The school’s PTR is 94, well above the Malawi average of 68. “Our environment at this school doesn’t meet the requirements of some teachers, particularly female teachers,” says the headteacher, Dickson Kachamba. “Teachers arrive at Nathenje and see the conditions here, and immediately start to try to transfer to the schools in the trading center. Recently one came and was here for only a week before transferring to a nearby school to be near his wife.” By contrast, at Mwatibu school, on the outskirts of Nathenje village, the PTR is just 34.

Brief Overview

Until recently, data on the whereabouts of teachers was fragmented and inconsistent between government agencies. As a result, teacher allocation policies have been broad, malleable, and inconsistently enforced. All Schools with a PTR above 60 – three in four schools – have been eligible to receive new staff each year, so teachers are not effectively targeted to the neediest schools. A hardship allowance scheme, intended to reward a minority of teachers working in remote schools, is received by more than 80% of teachers, rendering it ineffective as an incentive. While schools in remote areas struggle with a lack of teachers, those with a legitimate need to work closer to urban areas – for example, those with medical conditions requiring regular treatment – do not always succeed in obtaining transfers. One teacher
transferred schools three times, attempting to obtain a less remote position, before arriving at Nsanjiko ten years ago. “I have asthma. I want to be near the hospital,” he says. “The last two times I transferred I provided a medical certificate. I said I wanted to be in town but they said that at Nsanjiko there is understaffing, and if I came here, maybe they could help me in a few years. But I’m still here. I don’t know why they are ignoring my views; others have left for town after working here for two-three years, but not me.”

Working with central- and district-level officials, a team at the World Bank developed the first up-to-date, accurate, and comprehensive database of all Malawi’s primary school teachers and their current school postings. They then identified and analyzed the driving factors behind PTR variation. The analysis confirmed that the aspects of remoteness identified by teachers as key sources of hardship in remote postings are highly predictive of PTR variation. These were the distance of the school from the nearest trading center (meaning a village or settlement with commercial businesses, but not necessarily the district center); but also the availability of basic amenities at the school, such as electricity and a road that is accessible even during the rainy season; and the availability of particular facilities at the trading center, such as a bank, hospital or clinic, and piped water and electricity. The fact that PTR varies according to these factors provided evidence that teachers are able to exercise considerable influence over placements, meaning that staff shortages are most severe where teachers do not want to be placed.

Through focus group discussions and political economy network mapping, the team identified the channels through which teachers exercise this influence. District Education Managers (DEMs), Headteachers, village chiefs, and other stakeholders contributed to the discussions, developing a picture of how teachers apply pressure through formal and informal channels to avoid being placed in remote schools. Officials struggle to adopt a firm line in the face of this pressure, particularly when well-connected teachers convince a political figure or high-ranking official to intervene on their behalf. “People want their friends to be at a school they feel is not remote,” said one DEM. “You have to be strong and be prepared to create enemies.”

Using these findings, the team developed a new three-level A-C classification of school remoteness, capturing not only physical location but also school-level and trading center facilities. It provides a simple and accurate categorization that captures the key factors that influence teachers to lobby for or resist placement in schools. Using this new, more nuanced categorization, the team developed two policy reforms designed to rapidly reduce disparities in teacher numbers without any additional costs. First, the annual deployment of 5,000 new teachers is now being targeted to Category A and B schools, those deemed the most remote. This method should prove much more effective than the previous policy in allocating new teachers to the neediest schools.

Second, reforms are underway to the hardship allowance scheme to achieve the original goal of providing a meaningful bonus to teachers working in the most remote schools. The improved scheme will provide a monthly allowance of $35.00 (equivalent to roughly one-third of an average teacher’s salary), targeted to the 20% of teachers who work in the most remote schools, with a reduced amount for teachers in moderately remote schools. This is expected to lessen the pressure from teachers to avoid remote postings, and to incentivize them to stay in or move to hardship schools. The new policy is expected to be rolled out in 2020.

Evidence and Outcomes

The new categorization was introduced for the first time in 2017 to guide the deployment to schools of 4,570 new teachers. DEMs were instructed to prioritize schools in the ‘most remote’ and ‘remote’ categories over those in the ‘not remote’ category. A series of regional-level workshops introduced district officials to the new categorization and the rationale for the change. Many district officials were very successful in allocating almost all their teachers to remote schools. Nationwide, 76% of the new teachers were allocated to schools which were in either the ‘remote’ or ‘most remote’ categories. 42% were sent to the most remote category of schools, an important step in rebalancing the distribution of teachers towards these most needy schools.
Improved targeting of teachers is now becoming a central aspect of Malawi’s teacher management system. In 2018, a further 7,000 new teachers were deployed to schools. Almost half (49%) of these teachers were deployed to schools with more than 100 pupils per teacher, a huge improvement in the ability of the system to target teachers to the schools with the greatest need.

Moreover, the dialogue around evidence-based policymaking in Malawi is moving from reliance on simplistic ‘headline figures’ to one based on credible, detailed and reliable data. Malawi is piloting high-frequency, tablet-based collection of data on key school indicators, and conducting a large-scale, nationally representative longitudinal schools survey collecting a wide range of data on conditions, practices, and outcomes in Malawi’s Primary schools. These new forms of data will support the government in creating additional rules-based frameworks for decision-making, and equip the government to measure the impact of reforms and projects.

**Limitations, Challenges, and/or Lessons Learned**

Despite the success of the effort to improve initial allocations of teachers to schools, embedding the second aspect of the planned reforms – improved hardship allowances for teachers in remote postings – has proven more difficult than expected. In order for the planned reform to be revenue neutral, it is required to retract the allowance from teachers who currently receive it despite being in non-remote schools. However, this has proven politically unpalatable, leading to delays in implementation of the planned reforms. At present, the task team is investigating potential sources of development partner finance to support the introduction of the revised allowance scheme as an additional allowance without requiring the removal of the existing, low-value allowance from current recipients. This is expected to be resolved allowing the allowance to be introduced during 2020.
3: Case Studies on School Leadership
3.1 Gender sensitized teacher leads transformative change for Meo Muslim girls during India’s COVID-19 school lockdowns.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>CARE India</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Author</td>
<td>Seema Rajput</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Locations</td>
<td>Haryana State, India</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher Profiles</td>
<td>National teachers and school leaders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Topic</td>
<td>School Leadership</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Description of Crisis-Specific Challenge

Nuh district is regarded as one of the most marginalized districts in Haryana, India. Girls and women empowerment indicators, like literacy rate and school enrolment rate, continue to be among the lowest in the country, with available data showing a female literacy rate of 36.6% (Directorate of Census Operations, 2011) and average drop out of Muslim girls at 39.62% (National University of Education Planning and Administration, 2016). The pandemic has further worsened the status of girls’ education in the district.

The pandemic has not only affected family incomes and, therefore, their ability to invest in girls’ education, but it also adversely impacted the socio-emotional wellbeing of adolescent girls. In Haryana, 70.2% of girls reported an increase in responsibility for household chores and 64% reported increased anxiety or stress in themselves and in their parents (CARE India, 2020). Additionally, 7.8% girls feared that they would be pushed into early marriage due to family’s economic hardship (CARE India, 2020). Another study by UNICEF (2021) highlighted that 80% of children aged 14-18 years reported lower levels of learning than when they were physically at school.

The pandemic has also caused schools to close for 13 out of the last 16 months in Haryana. It curtailed opportunities for girls to meet their friends and share their emotional hardships experienced during the pandemic. While some urban geographies in India were able to leverage digital media to bridge the gap left by school closures, low-income families of Nuh were left with limited opportunities to support their children, particularly adolescent girls.

Brief Overview

The Government of India has identified Nuh as the “most backward” district of India, which has a population of more than 90% Meo-Muslims (Kumar et al., 2017). In 2018, CARE conceptualized a District Resource Group (DRG) consisting of 20 local teachers to address the unique set of problems and aspirations of adolescent girls of this community. A systematic approach was used by CARE India to build the capacity of the DRG on the concepts of gender, equity, and the safety and security of girls. The DRG further trained 600 school teachers from 134 middle schools to equip them with strategies to promote gender equality within their classrooms by mobilising community for increased attendance and participation of girls, integrating positive examples of girls and women within in lesson plans; showcasing them as decision makers, raising awareness regarding the implications of gender discriminatory social norms (like child/early marriage and teenage pregnancy), and introducing of life-skill curriculum for girls.

Soon after the onset of COVID-19, when all schools were closed for an uncertain period, Kusum, one of the DRG members, played a critical role with support from the girls from Balika Manch (school-level girls’ clubs) in creating awareness on COVID-19 amongst the community. Kusum conceptualised the
innovative idea of Mohalla Pathshala (Community learning centre (CLC)) in 50 villages near her school. This model was appreciated and later scaled up by District Education Officers in the entire district to ensure learning is continued despite school closures. She mobilised educated youth within the community and trained them to effectively run the CLCs following COVID safety protocols. In addition to the Mohalla Pathshala initiative, Kusum took the lead with other DRG members to visit all neighbourhood schools to orient school teachers to effectively implement COVID protocols and ensure all children are back to school by mobilising the community. Orientation was also provided to activate school-based leadership platforms for children to share their experiences with each other and build resilience.

Kusum says that “In the past, I got the opportunity to attend training on gender by the education department, but they were not very useful. CARE India’s reflective and experiential training programs helped broaden my vision around gender issues and helped with planning activities in schools and the community for promoting girls’ education. They provided wings to my ambitions for bringing each girl into school”. Initially, participation of girls at the CLCs was a challenge as the girls were engaged in domestic chores and in farms. Kusum mobilized parents with support from SMCs by conducting door to door visits encouraging them to send their girls to the CLCs. This resulted in more than 70% of girls enrolling at CLCs.

**Evidence and Outcomes**

Qualitative data¹ suggests that the District Resource Group model for building decentralized leadership in Haryana has been instrumental in addressing critical needs that emerged during the COVID-19 pandemic. Most notably, DRG member Kusum Mallik anchored collaborations with the district education office to ensure the establishment of Mohalla Paathshalas (Community learning centres)². Media reports³ show that this initiative, originally conceptualized by Kusum Mallik, reached 2700 children from 50 villages, and was later scaled to 5000 students (6-18 years) with more than 70% girls through 250 centres in 130 villages.

The CLCs were implemented by educated community youth with mentoring provided by teachers, who helped ensure appropriate COVID safety protocols were in place and that a safe space was provided by community members. Via telephone, Kusum Malik and other DRG members trained community mentors on maintaining COVID safety protocols and effective teaching and learning processes for the context of COVID-19. Kusum Mallik’s initiative was appreciated and supported by her students in class 12. She told us, “My students were motivated to teach younger children from their community. I now see an ecosystem of support being developed at the community level through my students.”

Anecdotal evidence and student feedback indicates that there was impressive reach to previously under-served communities through the Mohalla Paathshaalas. Continued participation of girls in the learning centres resulted in girls being connected with learning and being back to school after reopening. According to school records, 100 percent of the girls attending community learning centres returned to school after reopening. Their participation in CLCs also helped mitigate the early and forced marriage. Emerging data (anecdotal) on school attendance since school reopening earlier this month (September, 2021) also shows low dropout rates in the schools where district resource group members were active in community mobilization.

---

¹ Process document on District Resource Group, 2020, CARE India
² https://www.facebook.com/ndtv/videos/for-students-missing-online-classes-haryana-districts-community-classrooms/340772047921099/
³ https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=PVJHT78KIOE
Limitations, Challenges, and/or Lessons Learned

Kusum reported that the community was initially hesitant towards setting up of CLCs due to the spread of the virus. Such issues were addressed by Kusum through discussions and meetings with the community leaders, and by ensuring that adequate safety protocols were in place. She also advocated for community members and parents to consider the dire implications of learning discontinuity on children’s education, development, and wellbeing outcomes.

In addition to the learning challenges addressed by Kusum and other DRG members through Mohalla Paathshalas, issues of socio-emotional wellbeing were also prominent during the school lockdown. Therefore, there is an emerging need for schools to follow a structured curriculum that also addresses the socio-emotional learning (SEL) needs of children. Kusum Mallik is now leading the discussion at the district level to bring SEL into focus at the school level.

While CARE’s program for building a cadre of district level changemakers in the form of DRG was successful in bridging children’s learning needs, institutional support will be crucial to keep this cadre of changemakers motivated. It is very important that these kinds of DRGs are institutionalised in the system and engaged in planning and implementing context specific solutions to address the gender gap in education.

A major lesson that emerged from Kusum’s efforts was that a strong sense of ownership and accountability in teachers can make them change makers. Kusum was able to influence the community, her peer teachers, and the district education department to prioritize education of children in times of pandemic.

References


3.2 Learning from school leaders in crisis contexts: A case study of Kakuma refugee camp and Kalobeyei settlement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organizations</th>
<th>Teachers College, Columbia University</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Authors</td>
<td>Emily Ervin, Jonathan Kwok, Danielle Falk, &amp; Dr. Mary Mendenhall</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Locations</td>
<td>Kakuma Refugee Camp and Kalobeyei Settlement, Kenya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher Profiles</td>
<td>Refugee teachers, National teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Topic</td>
<td>School Leadership</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Description of Crisis-Specific Challenge**

School leaders, following classroom teachers, are a critical factor of learner success (Day et al., 2020; Sampat et al., 2021). Unfortunately, school leaders (head teachers/principals and deputy head teachers/assistant principals) often do not receive sufficient professional training to fulfill the myriad roles and responsibilities asked of them (Mendenhall et al., 2021). These challenges are compounded in crisis-affected contexts, placing an added burden on school leaders to navigate challenging professional situations with few resources, training, and support (Burns & Lawrie, 2015). Despite their central role, school leaders remain an under-researched and under-prioritised population in crisis-affected contexts.

Kakuma refugee camp and Kalobeyei settlement in northwest Kenya currently host close to 200,000 refugees and asylum-seekers from over 20 countries of origin (UNHCR, 2020). Refugee children and youth attend 27 primary schools run by non-governmental organisations Lutheran World Federation (LWF; Kakuma camp) and Finn Church Aid (FCA; Kalobeyei settlement) in partnership with UNHCR. Previously, both incentive and national teachers served as Head Teachers (HTs) or Deputy Head Teachers (DHTs) in Kakuma and Kalobeyei. However, the enforcement of a national policy stipulating job requirements for HTs, including advanced educational attainment, resulted in Kenyan HTs replacing all refugee HTs in 2018. Thus, incentive teachers who were previously HTs were assigned DHT positions to ensure that every school’s leadership structure aligns with the national policy. Additionally, a “localization” policy in Kenya stipulating that HTs do not stay in their post for more than five years, led to transfers of staff between schools on an uncertain basis. Taken together, these policies resulted in myriad disruptions and changes for school leaders working in Kakuma and Kalobeyei over the last several years.

**Brief Overview**

The research team explored the roles and responsibilities of school leaders, the challenges and opportunities they face, and the support needed and desired to effectively carry out their works. Our qualitative study draws on interview and focus group discussion (FGD) data from 35 incentive and national school leaders in Kakuma and Kalobeyei to investigate their collective experiences while also elucidating the relationship between national HTs and incentive DHTs. Since this study took place during the COVID-19 health pandemic, we conducted 17 phone interviews with either an HT or DHT at each school, using purposive sampling criteria to reflect gender, nationalities, and years teaching among participants. It is important to note that female school leaders remain underrepresented, com-

---

1. Because refugees are not able to obtain a legal work permit and may not have the necessary or recognized qualifications for joining the national teaching cadre, refugees are excluded from salaried positions and are instead offered an incentive of approximately KSH 8000 (~$70 USD) from NGO partners.
2. This study contributes to a larger initiative led by the University of Fribourg and funded by the Swiss National Science Foundation. The Teachers College research team will produce a case study on Kakuma Refugee Camp and Kalobeyei Settlement for the Educational Leadership 2.0 project, a compendium of teaching case studies via a virtual learning platform. Our study will: 1) create a teaching case study that highlights key issues for school leaders; and 2) pilot the teaching case study with our participants to gauge effectiveness.
posing only 26% of the school leadership cadre. All 54 school leaders were invited to participate in four virtual FGDs facilitated via WhatsApp based on their location and position (i.e., HTs in Kakuma). The team provided a small financial incentive to all participants to offset costs for data and electricity while emphasising voluntary participation. In total, 11 school leaders were interviewed and participated in WhatsApp FGDs, 6 only participated in interviews, and 18 only participated in WhatsApp FGDs.

We conducted iterative coding of interview transcripts and FGD data independently, disaggregated by the participant’s leadership role. Then we identified key themes that emerged across both datasets. Through our analysis, we identified four key roles and responsibilities of school leaders in Kakuma and Kalobeyei. The first entails a leadership role encompassing academic content and school climate responsibilities, such as being a role model, ensuring curriculum implementation, and chairing the school disciplinary committee. Second, a managerial role to coordinate the daily functions of the school, like the feeding program and co-curricular activities. Third, an administrative role that oversees and implements school data and learner enrollment, as well as serving as the Secretary of the Board of Management (BOM) for the school. Fourth, an ambassador role to liaise with myriad stakeholders across the school ecology, including teachers, parents, and NGO/UN partners. COVID-19 adds a layer of complexity to school leadership roles, compounding the existing constraints of the protracted crisis in Kakuma and Kalobeyei, as school leaders have to take on additional responsibilities for distributing radios for home-based instruction during school closures, and health and hygiene materials to learners that may be insufficient for meeting everyone’s needs. Considering the breadth of these roles, school leaders frequently expressed feeling overwhelmed and ill-equipped to fulfil all of their responsibilities.

Evidence and Outcomes

Preliminary data analysis elucidates four challenges that school leaders face. First, schools in Kakuma and Kalobeyei are overcrowded and under-resourced. A shortage of teachers and limited infrastructure have led to large classrooms, challenging quality teaching, monitoring, and equitable utilisation of resources. Four of the 8 DHTs struggled to perform data management and report writing duties with insufficient technological resources and support, which makes reporting to NGO partners difficult. One DHT insisted that schools need “more staff, and the building, learning resources, and teaching resources must be improved.” School leaders are often blamed for the shortcomings of limited resources within the schools, which strains their relationships with teachers and community members.

Second, school leaders face challenges in developing a positive school culture. Eight of the 17 participants indicated challenges related to disciplinary issues such as truancy or misbehaviour, at times caused by cultural differences between learners. School leaders involve parents and the Board of Management to address indiscipline. However, six HTs voiced challenges communicating with stakeholders, noting language and cultural barriers complicating conflict resolution within the school. Five school leaders also noted challenges between national and incentive teachers. One DHT felt that “being a refugee you are not educated, so [Kenyans] have that mentality of thinking that refugees are not competent to maybe do what a Kenyan is supposed to do” which makes collaboration difficult.

Overwhelmingly, HTs and DHTs alike found purpose in their role as school leaders, with 12 of the 17 participants expressing dedication and passion for their work. Despite this sense of vocation, 3 HTs and 5 DHTs discussed the challenges for staying motivated in their positions, feeling a lack of respect, autonomy, or recognition for their work as the third challenge. More specifically, DHTs detailed lack of financial incentives, heavy workloads, minimal support, and limited opportunities for career progression unique to their refugee status. One DHT reflected that the discrepancy in remuneration between HTs and DHTs is “not motivating ... because we are paid less money compared to the person doing the same work.” This sentiment elicited tensions in school leaders’ perceptions of the imbalanced value between HTs and DHTs.

3 This underrepresentation stems from fewer girls graduating from school or pursuing secondary/post-secondary education required to serve as a school leader.
School leaders discussed limited opportunities for comprehensive and relevant professional development, the fourth challenge. Six HTs and 4 DHTs expressed a desire to engage in training opportunities relevant to their myriad responsibilities as well as other skills such as time management, problem solving, and managing multiple responsibilities concurrently.

**Limitations, Challenges, and/or Lessons Learned**

We advocate for increased comprehensive professional opportunities for school leaders to develop skills and build a community of practice with their peers. Amidst our research process, school leaders themselves have offered encouragement and advice to their peers, revealing the wealth of knowledge and support that school leaders can offer one another when engaged in professional development opportunities. The formation of communities of practice represents how mentorship and collaboration from induction through long-standing service can bolster school leaders’ professional identity and practice. These communities of practice foster knowledge sharing, encourage collaborative brainstorming to address challenges, and motivate school leaders with camaraderie and motivation in environments where external support and resources are scarce. Implementing organisations should consider school leaders as a key stakeholder in interventions, beyond gatekeepers to schools, and develop strategies to support school leaders’ success. Policymakers and government partners can strengthen education systems by drawing on diverse lived experiences and expertise of school leaders for mutual learning across the national and refugee school leadership cadre. Donors should allocate more resources towards research and practice surrounding school leadership to develop a stronger evidence base of how school leaders support holistic learning and development in crisis-affected contexts.

**References**


**Links**

- [Comparative Educational Leadership Lab](#)